

VU Research Portal

review van: Wonder en geweld. De Molukken in de verbeelding van vertellers en schrijvers [Review of: H. Straver (2007) Wonder en geweld. De Molukken in de verbeelding van vertellers en schrijvers (2dln)]

Schutte, G.J.

published in

Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde
2009

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Schutte, G. J. (2009). review van: Wonder en geweld. De Molukken in de verbeelding van vertellers en schrijvers [Review of: H. Straver (2007) Wonder en geweld. De Molukken in de verbeelding van vertellers en schrijvers (2dln)]. *Bijdragen tot de taal-, land- en volkenkunde*, 165, 417-419.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Book reviews

Des Alwi, *Friends and exiles; A memoir of the nutmeg isles and the Indonesian nationalist movement*. Edited by Barbara S. Harvey. Ithaca, New York: South East Asia Program Publications, Cornell University, 2008, vii + 171 pp. ISBN 9780877277446. Price: USD 20.95 (paperback).

CHRIS F. VAN FRAASSEN
Goes (Netherlands)
fraassen@wxs.nl

Des Alwi was born on 17 November 1927 in Banda Neira, capital of the fabled 'Nutmeg Isles'. His maternal grandfather, Said Tjong Baadilla (1859-1933), born from a marriage between an Arab entrepreneur and a daughter of the head of the Chinese community in Banda, was a very prominent figure in Bandanese society. He had got fabulous rich by the exploitation of pearl banks. However, in the beginning of the 1930s he became bankrupt and shortly thereafter he passed away, according to Des Alwi in this memoir (p. 15) in 1934, and according to other sources on February 4, 1933.

Des Alwi's paternal grandfather, Pangeran Omar, descended from the royal dynasty of Palembang. He came to the Moluccas to seek information about the fate of his grandfather, Sultan Mahmud Badaruddin of Palembang (1818-1821), who had been banned to Ternate in 1825, where he died in 1852. Des Alwi's father was born in Ternate and came to Banda in 1912, where he got a job in the Baadilla fleet. He married a daughter of Said Tjong Baadilla in 1923.

After the Baadilla glory had crumbled in the early 1930s, Des Alwi grew up in destitute circumstances. Nevertheless, in *Friends and exiles* he looks back on a relatively carefree youth. In reading his memories of that time we get a vivid impression of a very mixed society in Banda, characterized by amiable manners and easy-going contact between people of quite different backgrounds.

Des Alwi's parents, however, had to cope with a big problem, due to the nature of colonial society: as the Baadilla family had lost status due to financial misfortune, it became very difficult to get Des Alwi enrolled at the European Elementary School (ELS), a school reserved for children of European descent and for children whose parents could afford a European lifestyle. It was not until July 1935 that Des Alwi, then eight years old, was able to enter the ELS.

Having been from time immemorial a place of exile for criminals from other parts of the Netherlands Indies, in the twentieth century Banda became a place of exile for leaders of the nationalist movement. Prominent exiles in Banda included Tjipto Mangunkusumo (1928-1941) and Iwa Kusuma Sumantri (1930-1941), both of whom were accompanied by their families. In February 1936 two other prominent exiles arrived in Banda: Mohammad Hatta (1902-1980) and Sutan Sjahrir (1909-1966). Both were intellectuals, educated in universities in the Netherlands. They brought no family with them to Banda.

By coincidence, the boy Des Alwi came into contact with Sjahrir and Hatta at the moment they came ashore and were in need of local assistance. Sjahrir and Hatta hired a house together and established a joint bachelors' household. Soon Des Alwi and some of his relatives became part of that household. Sjahrir in particular, being more 'boyish' in his behaviour than the very serious and introverted Hatta, seems to have enjoyed the company of children. He took four children of the Baadilla family under his care: Des Alwi, his sister Lily, his cousin Mimi, and his nephew Ali, who was still a baby, but whom Sahrir fed with canned milk. Sjahrir and Hatta brought up and educated these children, who for their part performed small duties in the household of the two bachelors and provided them with a link to local society. In an informal way, Sjahrir became the children's foster father. The real parents, it seems, felt that their children were better off with him.

After the outbreak of war with Japan, Hatta and Sjahrir were evacuated to Java on a Catalina aeroplane. The connection between Sjahrir and his 'adopted' children was by now so close that he decided to bring them with him to Java. However, space on the plane being limited, Des Alwi had to make the trip to Jakarta by boat, via Ambon and Surabaya. Having been reunited with Sjahrir in July 1942, Des Alwi became a member of Sjahrir's entourage in Java and played a role, albeit a modest one, in the Indonesian Revolution. In his memoir he describes his experiences and adventures up to 1947, when he left Indonesia for further education in Europe.

All in all, this autobiographical document gives us a clear and unadorned picture of an in every way interesting youth spent in pre-war colonial Banda, and in Java during the Japanese occupation and national revolution. Particularly interesting are the insights which Des Alwi gives us into the very different characters of Sutan Sjahrir and Mohammad Hatta.

James A. Anderson, *The rebel den of Nùng Trí Cao; Loyalty and identity along the Sino-Vietnamese frontier*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2007, 296 pp. ISBN 9780295986890. Price: USD 30.00 (paperback).

EMMANUEL POISSON

Paris Diderot University

emmanuel.poisson@univ-paris-diderot.fr

The history of frontiers in Asia is a topic currently receiving renewed interest within the academic community.¹ James Anderson's monograph *The rebel den of Nùng Trí Cao* is a good illustration of this trend. Building on a variety of sources, Anderson focuses on three groups of actors – the rulers of China and Vietnam, and the Tai-speaking chieftain Nùng Trí Cao – in relation to the Sino-Vietnamese frontier during the eleventh century. His project is to go beyond the imperial historiography, which often depicts Nùng Trí Cao as a troublemaker, in order to understand the reasons why he attempted three times (in 1042, 1048 and 1052) to escape from both Chinese and Vietnamese domination. Anderson also tries to clarify Nùng Trí Cao's political objectives. Did he intend to establish an independent kingdom between the Chinese and Vietnamese empires? Or did he simply wish to create a semi-autonomous territory in order to enhance his authority and benefit from regional trade? Contrary to what was assumed by Sima Guang, Nùng Trí Cao's decision to rebel against Vietnamese and Chinese sovereigns was not due to his lack of understanding of these countries' institutions. Rather, it is very likely that his aspirations were linked with his deep knowledge of the local administration system in the borderlands. Anderson demonstrates that Nùng Trí Cao resorted to two different discursive strategies, appealing respectively to Confucian and to local terms of authority, in order to pursue his goals.

More generally, Anderson explores how Cao attempted to enhance his legitimacy. One interesting point in this regard is that he selected his lieutenants both from among Han settlers, and from the local Tai elite. An insightful hypothesis is that Nùng Trí Cao probably had recourse to his supporters' lasting memory of the ancient southern kingdom of Nam Việt (Nan Yue). Whereas Chinese sources argue that Nùng Trí Cao's aversion to the Vietnamese rulers was the reason behind his third rebellion, Anderson shows that such an explanation is not satisfactory, especially since Nùng Trí Cao's projected kingdom extended across both sides of the frontier. Anderson challenges the prevailing thesis in Vietnamese historiography since Hoàng

1 See, for example, *Extrême-Orient, Extrême-Occident* 28 (2006) (http://www.puv-univ-paris8.org/ouv_fiche.php?SCE=REVUE&CLE=426&CHAP=PRESENT), and Martin Gainsborough (ed.), *On the borders of state power; Frontiers in the Greater Mekong sub-region* (London: Routledge, 2009).

Xuân Hãn, asserting that the Lý court enjoyed much stronger popular support in the highlands than did the Song dynasty when conflict broke out between the two parties in 1075. He highlights convincingly the paradoxes of a historiography largely determined by nationalist imperatives. Most Vietnamese historians consider that in territories ruled by the Chinese court, people pursued a variety of different goals and interests, whereas in the lands under Vietnamese jurisdiction, solidarity and unity prevailed. But in fact from the mid-eleventh century onward, Chinese officials developed relations with the followers of Nùng Trí Cao. Anderson shows how in the course of that century, the border issue brought about a complete reconfiguration of relations between China and Vietnam. The conflicts between the two courts were focused initially on issues of succession and political legitimacy – that is, on ideological features of the tributary system – but ended up crystallizing around territorial control along the frontier. During the first half of the eleventh century, the Đại Việt gradually expanded its influence over the area while the Chinese emperor hardly attempted to exert his authority. However, from the 1050s onward, this relative indifference gave way to an increasingly intensive involvement reflecting a clear change of policy on the part of Wang Anshi. What was in fact at stake here was nothing less than control over the economic resources of the area. Using the written records left by the scholar-officials involved in the administration of the borderlands, Anderson shows that the new policy led to an institutional change whereby the *jimi* prefectures lost their autonomous status. Anderson's fieldwork-based survey of the contemporary cult of Nùng Trí Cao, meanwhile, highlights how that cult is assertive of identities on both sides of the border.

It is to be regretted that this manuscript has been somewhat carelessly edited and proofread, leaving a large number of errors in the diacritical signs in *quốc ngữ* terms. This being said, however, one can only emphasize that *The rebel den of Nùng Trí Cao* will certainly become a reference work of major importance for all those interested in the topic.

Reggie Baay, *De njai; Het concubinaat in Nederlands-Indië*. Amsterdam: Athenaeum-Polak en Van Genneep, 2008, 302 pp. ISBN 9789025363604. Price: EUR 18.95 (paperback).

MAYA SUTEDJA-LIEM

Bilthoven

mayahliem@gmail.com

In één uitzonderlijk zwartgallige recensie, tussen talloze andere lovende recensies in die over het boek *De njai* van Reggie Baay zijn verschenen, staat dat het in 2008 verschenen boek vooral voor kenners van de Indische letterkunde geen nieuws is. Het boek zou bovendien een aanéenschakeling zijn van annotaties uit vorige boekwerken (<http://www.vanstockum.nl/product/10018888/De-njai.html>, een recensie ingezonden door W.A. Gorgel op 17 augustus 2008). Deze kritiek is gemakkelijk te weerleggen. Er zijn inderdaad eerdere studies over de *njai*, de inlandse concubine, in Nederlands-Indië uitgekomen. Veel geciteerd (ook door Baay) zijn onder andere de studie door Gelman Taylor (1986) over Europese en Euraziatische vrouwen in Nederlands-Indië gedurende de periode van de VOC, door Pollmann (1986) over de *njai* in de Nederlands-Indische samenleving die gekenmerkt werd door apartheid en de *njai* in de koloniale roman, vervolgens ook door Locher-Scholten (1992) over de *njai* in de Deli plantages. Toch onderscheidt het boek van Baay zich van de vorige publicaties in het feit dat het boek handelt over een lange, aaneengesloten periode van de geschiedenis van het concubinaat in Nederlands-Indië en de rol van de *njai* daarin, namelijk vanaf de tijd van de VOC tot het einde van de koloniale periode. Het boek is – in zeer toegankelijke taal – geschreven voor een breed publiek, niet uitsluitend voor kenners van de Indische letterkunde of academici. Hiermee bewijst Baay een goede dienst aan iedereen die interesse heeft voor de Nederlandse koloniale geschiedenis. De geschiedenis van het concubinaat en van de *njai* is voor het merendeel van de Nederlandse lezer een onbekende geschiedenis. In recensies wordt veelal gesproken van ‘een verborgen geschiedenis’, en men reageert onthutst over het bestaan van de *njai*, die in sommige recensies cynisch wordt aangeduid met ‘de verzwegen bijslaap’, ‘de vergeten “inlandsche meubels”’, ‘onze eigen troostmeisjes’ of ‘de onvrijwillige inlandse seksslavinnen’. Het wordt Baay in dank afgenomen dat hij deze ‘verborgen koloniale geschiedenis’ van Nederland heeft onthuld.

De auteur beschrijft vier vormen van concubinaat, te weten het concubinaat als vervanger van de slavernij in de handelsvestigingen van de VOC, het ‘vrijwillige’ concubinaat in de civiele wereld dat een combinatie vormt van bijzit en huishoudsterschap, het kazerne concubinaat en ten slotte het concubinaat op de plantages. Hij begint in Hoofdstuk 1 met een schets van de

omstandigheden in handelsvestigingen van de VOC in Azië, waar het beeld beheerst werd door de aanwezigheid van ongehuwde jonge mannen met pioniersgeest. Een nopend gebrek aan Europese huwbare vrouwen bracht de mannen ertoe met inlandse vrouwen – meestal slavinnen aangeschaft op de slavenmarkt – samen te leven zonder de verplichtingen die bij een huwelijk horen hoeven te dragen. Gouverneur-Generaal Jan Pieterszoon Coen was een felle tegenstander van deze samenlevingsvorm; een huwelijk met een niet-christelijke vrouw was immers verboden. Hij stelde daarop een verbod in en paste de politiek van blanke bruiden toe: vrouwen, veelal afkomstig van Nederlandse weeshuizen, werden naar de handelsvestigingen verscheept. Tegenstand van de Heren van de Compagnie en van Coens opvolgers, die juist veel voordelen zagen in de vrijblijvende en goedkope samenlevingsrelatie tussen dienaren van de Compagnie en Aziatische vrouwen, bracht een einde aan de politiek van blanke bruiden, hetgeen het voortbestaan van het concubinaat verder in de hand werkte. Dit werd versterkt door het overeind blijven van strenge huwelijksbepalingen, waarbij het voor een dienaar van de Compagnie verboden was om met een niet-christelijke vrouw te trouwen en voor een laaggeplaatste dienaar de bepaling gold dat er slechts na toestemming van zijn superieuren kon worden getrouwd.

Het tijt keerde enigszins tijdens het Engelse tussenbewind, toen er door de komst van Britse onderdanen – zeer gesteld op hun eigen cultuur en op moderne Europese opvattingen – een grotere maatschappelijke afkeuring voor het concubinaat ontstond. Deze leidde enerzijds tot een opwaardering en een aanpassing van de inlandse bijzit aan de Europese cultuur middels een wettig huwelijk, anderzijds nam het concubinaat clandestien toe – niet iedereen kon zich immers een huwelijk veroorloven.

Het einde van het Engelse tussenbewind bracht een nieuwe groep Europeanen naar de kolonie, waaronder ook vrouwen en dochters van bestuursambtenaren. Evenals de Engelsen waren zij zeer gericht op de versteviging van de Europese identiteit. De verwerping van het concubinaat bleef bestaan. Echter, in de tweede helft van de negentiende eeuw kwam hierin een verandering. Zo is in Hoofdstuk 2 te lezen dat tot 1860 het concubinaat slechts ondergronds bestond, maar na die tijd tot 1880 het zichtbaarder en massaler werd. Baay wijt dit toe aan de afschaffing van de slavernij (1860): Europese mannen waren gedwongen een vrouw onder de vrije bevolking te zoeken. Terzelfder tijd deden zich in de kolonie nieuwe maatschappelijk ontwikkelingen voor als gevolg van een opvallende groei van de Europese bevolking, de opkomst van Europese ondernemingen en een eveneens explosieve bevolkingsgroei onder de inheemse bevolking met een enorme verslechtering van de sociaaleconomische situatie als gevolg daarvan. Meer dan ooit was er behoefte aan inlandse arbeidskrachten. Hieraan werd voldaan doordat de toenemende armoede onder de lokale bevolking een grote toestroom van

werkzoekenden richting de steden teweeg bracht. Mannelijke vrijgezellen onder de Europese nieuwkomers konden nu terecht bij lokale vrouwen die bij hen als huishoudsters in dienst traden. Zo ontstond een nieuwe vorm van concubinaat: de 'vrijwillige' concubinaat in de civiele wereld.

De auteur wijdt in Hoofdstuk 3 uitgebreid aandacht aan de institutionalisering van de 'vrijwillige' concubinaat tussen 1870 en 1920, tijdens de gouden eeuwen van de kolonie. De groei van de Europese bevolking als gevolg van betere verbindingen met Indië en de openlegging van het land voor het ondernemerschap gingen gepaard met nieuwe kansen in het zakelijke leven en nieuwe verhoudingen onder de bevolking. Als nooit tevoren was de superioriteit van de blanken over de inlandse bevolking in deze periode een vanzelfsprekendheid. In dit klimaat gedijde het concubinaat volop. Nog altijd was deze vorm van samenleven vanuit het perspectief van de ongehuwde Europese man de ideale vanwege het vrijblijvende karakter ervan en het verzorgende comfort dat de man daarvan genoot, voor zolang hij nog niet met een Europese vrouw was getrouwd. De inheemse/Aziatische vrouw was goed als een tijdelijk surrogaat. Het was hierom dat het concubinaat in brede lagen van de koloniale bevolking werd geaccepteerd en toegepast. Begin twintigste eeuw echter veranderde de houding ten aanzien van het concubinaat naarmate de welvaart onder de Europese bevolking steeg en de bevolkingssamenstelling geleidelijk wijzigde door de komst van meer Europese vrouwen en kinderen. De behoefte om het leven in te richten volgens de maatstaven van de Europese 'beschaving' groeide. Het concubinaat werd in toenemende mate als iets verwerpelijks gezien en in direct verband gebracht met degeneratie. Onder druk van felle negatieve geluiden ten aanzien van het concubinaat in publieke debatten en in het dagelijkse leven vaardigde de koloniale regering omstreeks 1910 een officiële afkeuring uit van het concubinaat voor ambtenaren. Hiermee nam het aantal Europese mannen die in concubinaat met inlandse/Aziatische vrouwen leefden tegen het einde van de koloniale periode sterk terug, wat met de komst van de Indonesische onafhankelijkheid ten slotte resulteerde in een definitief einde van het concubinaat.

Het relaas over het concubinaat in Nederlands-Indië zou niet volledig zijn zonder dat er melding wordt gemaakt van het ongehuwd samenwonen van Nederlandse militairen met inlandse/Aziatische vrouwen in de kazernes: het zogenoemde kazerneconcubinaat was pertinent aanwezig en bepaalde het beeld van het koloniale leger. Baay zet in Hoofdstuk 4 uitéén hoe sterk afhankelijk het koloniale leger was van de aanwezigheid van vrouwen in de kazernes; zonder vrouwen als lokmiddel kon de Nederlandse regering moeilijk aan de behoefte aan manschappen in de kolonie voldoen. Het kazerneconcubinaat was met formele toestemming van de Nederlandse regering in het leven geroepen om manschappen voor het leger te kunnen werven. Voor de Europese militairen was dit inderdaad de ideale samenlevingsvorm die zij

veelal verkozen boven een getrouwd leven, ook al konden ze zich een huwelijk permitteren of kregen zij daarvoor toestemming. Ook bood het inheemse vrouwen de mogelijkheid te ontsnappen aan de armoede thuis, zelfs wanneer zij daarmee zich in de ogen van de plaatselijke bevolking verlaagde en door hun eigen gemeenschap werd verstoten. In eerste instantie leek het een goed functionerend instituut, toch bracht het kazerneconcubinaat veel morele problemen met zich mee. Het kazerne maatschappij dat in de ogen van de burgerij altijd al gelijk stond met het verderfelijke leven, omdat het volledig los van de burgermaatschappij functioneerde en een eigen leef- en gedragscodes kende, trok in de tweede helft van de negentiende eeuw veel negatieve aandacht toen het probleem van geslachtsziekten ernstige vormen aannam. Men wees het concubinaat als veroorzaker daarvan. De roep om afschaffing van dit laatste werd in de kolonie en in Nederland dan ook steeds sterker. Felle debatten werden door politici in Nederland gevoerd. In Indië mengde zelfs de aartsbisschop zich in het gesprek en veroordeelde het kazerneconcubinaat op morele gronden. Toch zou het decennia lang duren voordat er daadwerkelijk een verbod op het kazerneconcubinaat zou komen. De reden was dat de legerleiding in Indië, gesteund door de Raad van Indië en de minister van Koloniën, veel praktische voordelen in het concubinaat zag, die de gevechtswaarde van het leger belangrijk deden toenemen. Uiteindelijk zou pas in 1913, drie jaar na de afschaffing van het concubinaat in de civiele maatschappij, een verklaring door het gouvernement van Indië worden uitgevaardigd dat het kazerneconcubinaat afgeschaft zou worden. Pas in 1919 kwam het verbod daadwerkelijk.

Ten slotte komt het plantageconcubinaat in Hoofdstuk 5 aan bod. De auteur beperkt zich tot de situatie op de plantages van Deli, omdat daar meer dan op andere plantages concubinaatrelaties voorkwamen die gekenmerkt waren door de grote ongelijkheid tussen de Europese man en de vrouwelijke koelie die als concubine diende. Het relaas concentreert zich dan ook op de harde, uitzichtloze situatie waaronder vrouwelijke koelies op de plantages te werk werden gesteld en aan de eisen van de plantagehouders moesten voldoen. Inheemse vrouwen werden in grote getale voor de plantages geworven. Dit was deels om aan de grote vraag aan contractarbeiders te voldoen en deels om aan de sociale en seksuele behoeften van de mannelijke contractkoelies en de Europese plantagehouders te voorzien, voor wie trouwbepalingen golden, waardoor zij niet door een Europese echtgenote naar Deli konden worden vergezeld. In de planterswereld van Deli, gekenmerkt door een harde pioniersmentaliteit en overmatig drankgebruik, waren veel extreme gevallen van onrecht, uitbuiting en fysiek geweld ten aanzien van vrouwelijke koelies bekend. Vrouwen die als concubines van Europese planters werden aangesteld bleven niet altijd gespaard van geweld en uitbuiting, hoewel ze over het algemeen in betere levensomstandigheden verkeerden

dan de andere koelies.

De aantrekkelijkheid van het boek heeft veelal te maken met het feit dat de auteur zich niet heeft beperkt tot een droge opsomming van historische feiten en politieke maatregelen omtrent het concubinaat. Meer dan dat besteedt hij aandacht aan de sociale- en economische omstandigheden waarin het concubinaat in de kolonie tot stand kwam en kon gedijen. De auteur is er volledig in geslaagd een levendige beeld te schetsen van die omstandigheden door meer dan eens uit oude reisverslagen, krantenartikelen en de Indische bellettrie te citeren. Echter, de ziel van het boek is vooral gelegen in die gedeelten waarin de auteur uiteenzet wat de gevolgen van het concubinaat voor de inlandse of de Aziatische vrouw en voor de kinderen uit het concubinaat waren. Zonder overdreven emotioneel te zijn geeft hij blijk van zijn sympathie voor de *njai* die in de regel de nadelige gevolgen van het concubinaat onderdond. Vanwege het vrijblijvende karakter van concubinaatrelaties was de *njai* volledig rechteloos en kon ze eenvoudigweg afgedankt worden wanneer haar Europese meester met een Europese vrouw trouwde, zonder recht te hebben op bezittingen en haar eigen kind(eren). Er was niemand die om haar lot bekommerde. Werd ze samen met haar kinderen aan haar lot overgelaten, dan trad er in de regel verwaarlozing van haar kinderen op. Baay besteedt in bijna alle hoofdstukken aandacht aan de problematiek van kinderen uit het concubinaat, maar wijdt aan het eind van het boek nog eens een heel hoofdstuk aan over. Hij stelt aan de orde de onheuse bejegening en structurele achterstelling van kinderen uit gemengde relaties – uitgezonderd van diegenen die in elitekringen waren opgegroeid – die, aldus Baay, in feite al sinds de tijd van de VOC in het officiële koloniale beleid waren ingebed. Baay wijst deze structurele maatschappelijke uitsluiting, gebrek aan goed onderwijs en verwaarlozing aan als oorzaak van het marginale bestaan van een groeiende groep van Indo-paupers al in de loop van de negentiende eeuw. De geschiedenis van de Indo-Europeanen is een interessant en uitermate belangrijk onderwerp binnen de koloniale geschiedenis, waarnaar in de toekomst veel meer aandacht moet uit gaan. Reggie Baay doet er goed aan om dit onderwerp in samenhang met de geschiedenis van het concubinaat te behandelen, omdat beide geschiedenissen onlosmakelijk met elkaar verbonden zijn.

Tot slot, het zou zeker niet misstaan wanneer het boek in de vertaalde versie in Indonesië aangeboden wordt.

Referenties

Gelman Taylor, Jean

1986 'Europese en Euraziatische vrouwen in Nederlands-Indië in de VOC-tijd', in: Jeske Reijs et al. (red.), *Vrouwen in de Nederlandse koloniën*, pp. 10-33. Nijmegen: SUN. [Jaarboek voor Vrouwengeschiedenis 7.]

Locher-Scholten, Elsbeth

1992 'The nyai in colonial Deli; A case of supposed mediation', in: Sita van Bemmelen et al. (red.), *Women and mediation in Indonesia*, pp. 265-81. Leiden: KITLV Press. [Verhandelingen 152.]

Pollmann, Tessel

1986 'Bruidstraantjes; De koloniale roman, de njai en de apartheid', in: Jeske Reijs et al. (red.), *Vrouwen in de Nederlandse koloniën*, pp. 98-125. Nijmegen: SUN. [Jaarboek voor Vrouwengeschiedenis 7.]

John Barker (ed.), *The anthropology of morality in Melanesia and beyond*. Aldershot, Hampshire: Ashgate, 2007, xxii + 235 pp. ISBN 9780754671855. Price: GBP 60.00.

JAAP TIMMER

Leiden University

jakob.timmer@gmail.com

This volume looks at how people in Melanesia (and Western Desert Aborigines) deal with moral dilemmas and challenges. It centres around the scholarly work of Kenelm Burridge, whose discussion on 'the moralities' emphasizes the importance of looking at predicaments, disagreements and arguments as situations in which moral assumptions are challenged, confirmed and amended. Moreover, the volume follows Burridge's special attention to 'exemplars' – the type of persons, typically leaders, who exemplify a society's moral compromises and contradictions. Burridge also paid significant attention to the figure of the Christian missionary in Melanesia, and this too is followed up by some of the contributors to *The anthropology of morality in Melanesia and beyond*, on the basis of recent research in this pervasively Christian region.

The contributors are mostly eminent scholars, and some of them have already dealt explicitly with issues of morality in their past work. Joel Robbins, for instance, explored the relationship between 'Christian morality' and 'traditional morality' among Urapmin of the remote West Sepik Province (Papua New Guinea) in his 2004 book *Becoming sinners; Christianity and moral torment in a Papua New Guinea society* (Berkeley: University of California Press). In that work, Robbins brings Sahlins and Dumont together to come up with an interpretational framework that combines relational culture with individualist culture. Robbins situates morality in relational networks that extend beyond the community, into modern institutions (state, church, schools, business) and into communities that are imagined (the nation, Christendom, indigenous people).

In his contribution to this volume, Robbins follows Burridge's discus-

sion of politics and morality with respect to the role of the big man as an exemplar, in particular in the contemporary context in which the state and election politics tend to become detached from the morality of every day. The big man is well known in Melanesian literature as the epitome of pragmatic politicking, but has rarely been viewed in terms of morality. Robbins shows, albeit without much ethnographic detail, that by transgressing moral rules, big men among the Urapmin get things done that the ordinary would not be able to achieve because they do not have enough display of will. The other of BurrIDGE's exemplars, the missionary, features in Roger Ivar Lohmann's chapter. This chapter narrates the rise and fall of Diyos, who led the Min people (including Telefolmin and Urapmin) to Christianity in the 1970s. Like big men, missionaries offer moral critique of the community and legitimize their actions with reference to a higher goal (the welfare of the community) or a moral standard (such as the will of God).

From the 'beyond Melanesia' of the title comes Robert Tonkinson's chapter on the moral and political implications of missionary efforts at Jigalong in the Western Australian desert during the 1960s. Tonkinson shows that fundamentalist Christian missions there show low tolerance for cultural difference. Their understanding of the nature of the indigenous Other prevents them from establishing the kind of positive portrait painted by BurrIDGE in *Encountering Aborigines* (1973). Among the best chapters must be ranked Doug Dalton's exploration of the moral enigmas that accompany sorcery beliefs and practices among Rawa speakers in Madang Province. Dalton shows that leaders and sorcerers mutually define each other in Rawa people's thinking and experience. Sorcerers also feature prominently in John Barker's piece on *kastom* (tradition), *lotu* (church), and *gavman* (government) exemplars among Maisin, and on the tensions which their plural identities entail.

Most eloquently exploring the emergence of social, economic, cultural differences is the chapter by Frederick Errington and Deborah Gewertz. They explore the site of a sugar factory, Ramu Sugar Limited, at which the moral consciousnesses of diverse Papua New Guineans come together and shape interactions. Ramu Sugar shapes its own moralities and imperatives, but in relation to new realities of class divisions and economic inequalities. Bruce Knauft contributes originally and clearly by drawing on rich ethnographic details relating to Gebusi speakers. He also looks at the effects of missionization, government, and the cash economy on people's moralities, and cleverly distills key points by comparing dynamics among Gebusi with details on Tangu provided by BurrIDGE. Prominent in this piece are the transformations brought and triggered by mission churches and Christianity. The relationship between morality and gender receives attention in Nancy Lutkehaus's account of a woman who succeeds in transcending women's traditional roles (gardener, household manager, mother, and wife) by becoming a missionary

nun in Africa.

Dan Jorgensen investigates issues of rupture and continuity by reflecting on Williams' study of Vailala Madness, which in the early 1920s sat uneasily with mainstream anthropology because it demonstrated that cultures are not integral wholes. In the light of this, Jorgensen explores the topic of *spirit meri*, female mediums among the Telefolmin who precipitated a charismatic movement known as *Rebaibal* during the 1970s. The thoughts and actions of the *spirit meri* set off radical mental and cultural transformations. Jorgensen's chapter shows that conversions of faith and morality may occur swiftly: perhaps not overnight, but rapidly and massively. Understanding the related disorder, both short- and long-term, is important for grasping change.

Surprisingly, this last insight is missing from Barker's introduction to the volume, which provides an overview of accounts of Melanesian moralities. While Barker stresses the importance of considering 'the ways anthropologists make sense of the particularities of others' and their moral choices (p. 1), his reflection on decades of research on morality does not result in a decisively new approach to this highly subjective dimension of human experience. The introduction fails to identify overall theoretical and methodological lessons learned. Barker did, however, invite the non-Melanesia anthropologist F.G. Bailey to seek such lessons, and in the final chapter Bailey shows how valuable a voice from beyond can be to the anthropology of a region. Bailey's is a fine essay which, if it were not so hard to digest, would make for good reading for students of anthropological methods.

The argument of Bailey's chapter runs something like this. So far, anthropology has tended to rely on two interpretive layers. The first is the template of the other, and the second is the template of the anthropologist who tries to make sense of the first. The relation between the two templates is generally problematic as the boundary between them often gets blurred in anthropological interpretations. Moreover, the perceived need for consistency and for all-inclusive explanations means that there is often little room for contradictions, let alone for loose ends. This contrasts, of course, with how things evolve in practice. To resolve the tension between reality and interpretation, Bailey proposes a triple hermeneutic for understanding people's worlds. This triple hermeneutic adds another interpretive layer, and points to weaknesses in the book's chapters.

Most of the chapters appear to suggest that in practice many Melanesians are in search of the ultimate truth of things. In accordance with that disposition, the researchers struggle with deep-rooted anthropological ideas about the Melanesian quest for amity, reciprocal exchange, and a perfect balance between people and cosmos – ideas which, intentionally or not, evoke images of times past, both for Melanesians and for the anthropologist. What, then, is left of all this in times of uncertainty, when conflict, individualism, money

politics, cheating, and suchlike abound?

All contributors have done research in Melanesia during modern times and under conditions that often arouse, both in themselves and among their informants, acute questions about morality. That issues of morality were also acute for Melanesians in the past, even if they seldom figured in outside observers' accounts, is evidenced in exceptional early works such as Kenelm Burridge's *Mambu*, as well as in a number of later ethnographies including those by Edward Schieffelin on the Kaluli, Nancy Munn on the Gawa, Michael French Smith on Kairuru Island, Arnold Epstein on the Tolai, and Laurence Goldman on the Huli (although these same anthropologists also sought to highlight the theories and practices that people develop to ensure that the centre can hold and chaos can be averted).

That the reality of individual and communal life does not always and not univocally engender an imagined millennium appears to concern anthropologists who today can hardly avoid noting wide varieties of opinions and conflicts, the effects of so-called failed states and poor governance, displacement and marginalization, poverty, racism, and so on. As a result much of their work, including this volume, reads like a cumulative critique of their own surprise and their own conceptual and theoretical shortcomings. Here, in my opinion, is where Bailey's additional third template becomes important, as it concerns the prejudices, preconceptions, ideologies and philosophical underpinnings of the anthropologist's templates (p. 191).

The first-level templates – the local ones – are narrated in the chapters of the book, while the second level is the most problematic as it evolves out of interactions between the third and the first. As Bailey observes, exemplars such as big men and religious leaders then come to appear as behaving unethically; yet the outcome of their immoral behavior is the preservation of society. This is the kind of observation which prevails in the book, but which avoids the question of to what extent ordinary people perceive the ultimate moral significance of what big men, religious leaders and politicians do. Of course in reality people do have such an awareness, and we must therefore conclude that many of the contributors to this volume remain stuck in the second level template, and construe the socio-political order in the communities they observe as a natural order.

Because most of the analyses in *The anthropology of morality in Melanesia* are pitched at this second level, they neglect the important ethnography of contradictory moralities, differences of opinion, and different levels of critique. We learn little about the growing variety of intellectual tools and ideas for underpinning morality. People wonder, dream, discover, and reflect in many different ways, and when trying to elicit the dynamics of change, one should look carefully at the roots of what people do and think. Some people refer to old constitutions, or formulate new ones; others look to the bible for moral

guidelines; others again seek inspiration in modern justice and civil rights, learning that all are equal and that the denial of equality is immoral. These different sources of moral authority may, of course, contradict each other, as when Old Testament teachings and the threat of damnation are used to justify discrimination against women and encourage obedience to the church.

This is not to dismiss the value of Barker's anthology. On the contrary, here we have an interesting collection of essays dealing with morality, a collection that greatly assists scholars keen to engage with the wide range of themes relating to this topic. I myself particularly enjoyed learning more about the work of Burridge, and seeing how much can be learned by reflecting from different points of view on the work of one doyen.

Kees Buijs, *Powers of blessing from the wilderness and from heaven; Structure and transformations in the religion of the Toraja in the Mamasa area of South Sulawesi*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2006, viii + 262 pp. [Verhandeligen, 229.] ISBN 9067182702. Price: EUR 30.00 (paperback).

ROBERT WESSING

Leiden

robertwessing@yahoo.com

This book, a revision of the author's doctoral dissertation, discusses a number of rituals practiced by the Toraja of Mamasa in South Sulawesi, with a special focus on the *pabisuan* ritual, which Buijs considers important for understanding 'the archaic roots of [Mamasa] religious thinking' (p. 6).

The book's introduction gives a brief sketch of the village of Mamasa, emphasizing its isolation and the consequent survival of traditions and rituals that have disappeared elsewhere. Contrasting the female *pabisuan* and the male headhunting rituals to be discussed later in the volume, the author asks whether these male and female elements can be related to male and female deities or male and female sources of blessing, such as those proposed by R. Schefold in several of his publications.

In the first chapter, Buijs gives an outline of the history and religion of the Toraja, particularly those of the mountainous northern part of South Sulawesi. A group of original immigrants was later joined, according to indigenous historical tradition, by *tomanurung*, descendants from heaven, who became the nobility (*puang*) and came to dominate the previous inhabitants (p. 11). Strangely, there is no mention here of the literature (for instance, by P.E. de

Josselin de Jong and M. Sahllins) concerning immigrant rulers and their ritual position. From a narration of their origin myth we learn that the people of Mamasa are the descendants of a marriage between a man who came from heaven and a woman who emerged from the waters. Custom (*adat*) is said to have originated by the deities, both those of the upper world ('heaven') and those of the earth (p. 22) – although later we learn that it was brought by the *tomanurun* when they descended from heaven (p. 35), and later again, that it is said to have come from the underworld (p. 149). While there is an otiose god, the Toraja concentrate on, and make offerings to, those with whom they can interact: the earth deities, and the ancestral deities in heaven.

Chapter 2 gives an overview of the literature that underpins this study, especially the writings of Stöhr on dualism and the connection between a community and its religion, and those of Schefold on the sources of blessing that bring the welfare necessary for a community's survival. Schefold points to an equivalence between the way in which the immigrant rulers (here, the sons of heaven) relate to autochthonous spiritual forces, and the way in which wife-takers relate to their wife-givers.

Chapter 3 continues this discussion with a consideration of Stöhr's characterization of a cosmology based on sexual dualism and the primordial marriage between heaven and earth, the cooperation between which brings fertility and life. As an illustration Buijs presents an origin myth about the separation of heaven and earth and the origin of the powers associated with each. In Buijs' view the primary contrast is between the upper world and the earth, the latter being the domain of the gods of the earth that live in the wilderness, which neatly relates his model to Schefold's sources of blessing. One aspect of this cosmology is a division of the earth-plane into east, the source of the gods, and west, the place where humans originated.

Toraja rituals, Chapter 4 explains, are correspondingly classified as belonging either to the east or to the west, the east being related to prosperity and life on earth, and the west being related to death. In addition there are complicating linkages between the west and the south, the direction taken by the dead on their way to the afterlife, and between the east and the north, the place where the gods of heaven are said to have descended to earth. At the same time, however, there is also a strong association between the west and the upper world, which seems to be at odds with the remainder of the scheme. Buijs notes that there are problems with the classification system as he constructs it, particularly with respect to the rituals concerning the cultivation of rice, which belongs to life and the east, but also involves ancestral deities who are associated with the west. The primary orientation, according to Buijs, is toward ancestral deities, although the earth deities are addressed too. This brings him to a tripartite classification of the rituals to be discussed in the book: (1) rituals with a focus on heaven and the ancestors; (2) rituals

with a focus on the earth deities as the recipients of thanksgiving rituals, and (3) rituals featuring a combination of the two foci.

Chapter 5 discusses the first category of rituals, those for the dead. This type of ritual aims to transform the deceased into gods from whom blessings can be expected (pp. 73, 174). Such rituals, however, are quite expensive, involving the slaughter of one or more water buffalo. Performing one increases the status of the family concerned. Not all families can afford to do this, which means that many deceased people do not reach heaven and remain in the realm of the dead. This does not seem to influence their status as givers of blessings, however. The east, and ultimately heaven, may therefore be considered simply as 'better neighborhoods' to spend eternity in, appropriate to the noble and the wealthy.

Buijs writes that the buffalo are presented to the dead in order to obtain their blessing (p. 75). Elsewhere in Indonesia, however, buffalo are often conveyances, originating in the underworld, that are involved in changes of position, including death, births, weddings, and the founding of states and other social units. The fact that a buffalo must be sacrificed to allow a commoner woman in Mamasa to marry a noble (p. 88), suggests that here too, the animal is partly a vehicle that makes possible changes of status.

Chapter 6 focuses on marriage and childbirth, which, like rice, depend on inputs from both heavenly and earthly forces. While fertility irreversibly depends on female powers, and wife-givers are seen as representatives of the gods, in order to prosper a child born of the marriage must be connected to male powers as well. This leads to a balance between the two forces, justifying Buijs' claim that wife-givers are not superior to wife-takers (p. 86).

The next chapter deals with death rituals for the nobility, and the megaliths erected for them. These megaliths are linked to an Austronesian idea of high-status immigrant sons of heaven who came to earth – although no mention is made of the relevant literature on megaliths, or on stranger kings. As was mentioned in Chapter 5, the death of a noble calls for the sacrifice of buffalo, making this an expensive occasion. The first of the sacrificed animals is identified with the deceased (serving, for instance, as a vehicle for him or her on the way to the afterlife). The dead head southward on their way to the realm of the dead and ultimately to heaven (p. 61), as the south, Buijs notes here (p. 106), is where the sons of the gods came to earth. Elsewhere, however (p. 60-61), we learned that the path to heaven lies in the north.

A rice ritual, *ma'dondi*, is discussed in Chapter 8. This tradition, which has now fallen into disuse, has women transplanting seedlings invite men to join them in the field and 'play' with them. If the men comply they take the women on their laps and embrace them (p. 110), a symbolic depiction of intercourse (p. 124). Whether it always remained just symbolic may be questioned, as in the past instances of intercourse in the fields to promote fertility have

been reported from various parts of Indonesia and mainland Southeast Asia. 'To play' is a common metaphor for copulation in several Indonesian languages, and the actuality of such activity would account for the 'tension' and 'frequent breakup of marriages' that Buijs notes occurred before the practice was forbidden (p. 110).

The actual growing of the rice crop is overseen by a 'rice priest' (*so'bok*), the man or woman that initiates each new stage in the cycle. This person is responsible for making the relevant offerings and making sure that everyone keeps to the rules. Offerings are made to the female earth spirit (*totiboyong*) that controls the water and the fertility in the area where the rice is grown. Yet this alone is not enough; blessings from the ancestors are also needed if the crop is to succeed. The introduction of new rice varieties in the mid-1970s altered the rice-cycle, causing the importance of the *so'bok* to diminish and most of the rituals to be discarded (p. 126).

The next ritual to be discussed is *mekolong*, which Buijs characterizes as a separation ritual. In myth, the action takes place between three worlds: the upper world, the underworld, and the earth. The underworld, Buijs emphasizes, is never a source of blessing in the rituals, whereas the earth is (p. 127, 223). However, several points seem to me to indicate that this lack of involvement of the underworld is only apparent. First, the Mamasa say that the wilderness on earth is connected to the underworld through holes and deep puddles (p. 56, 223). This link is also found in other Indonesian mythologies: the Ngaju Dayak, for instance, picture the earth and the underworld as connected mirror images of each other (Schärer 1963: Plate IV). Second, in the north there is a path between the earth and the underworld that connects them in an immense sea (p. 153). The initial separation, it seems, must have taken place between on the one hand the upper world, and on the other the combination of earth and underworld. It is significant that in one myth the people of Mamasa are descended from a marriage between a man from heaven and a woman who emerged from the water (p. 19). This marriage would then be between denizens of the upper- and the underworld respectively, reuniting on earth these two spheres that were separated during creation. Both the upper world and the underworld are associated with water. The man from heaven, Pongka Padang (p. 20), was driven away from his homeland by a great flood (p. 17) while the woman, Torijene, emerged from the waters. Given the connection between the two in the north, this presents us with an image of an arc of water with the upper- and underworlds at its extreme ends, between which lies the earth (Wessing 2006: 211-12).

The mythical and ritual focus on the wilderness as a source of blessings may well reflect the fact that the powers of the wilderness originated in the underworld/water (p. 54), but moved to earth, their movement being the source of their power, just as was noted earlier for the buffalo, which are

traditionally also associated with the underworld. Thus, the earth spirit *toti-boyong* is associated with water, a feature of the underworld, but is thought to reside in high places near the sources of water (p. 116).

The woman Torijene, however, seems to have arrived on earth first, and thus has precedence there. This is reflected in the role of the *toburake* priestess (Chapters 10 and 11), who precedes the heavenly ancestors, opening up the wilderness before them at the time of the founding of a community there (pp. 154-5, 196). She is said to have come from heaven, but she was found in the wilderness where she served the deities (p. 152), and originated according to some accounts in the waters in the west (p. 18), which may reflect the idea proposed above that heaven and the underworld form a continuum.

The *toburake* priestess leads the women in the *pabisuan* ritual, in which entranced women enter the forest and dance at or in a banyan tree, re-enacting Torijene's arrival on earth. The aim of this ritual for and by women, which is said to have originated in the underworld (p. 157), is to obtain blessings from the wilderness and at the same time give thanks for blessings received. The sacrificial animal is the pig, which is ritually associated with women (p. 93). If buffalo are slaughtered in this context, they are killed as if they were pigs. The *toburake*'s (and thus women's) precedence is illustrated by the fact that she is responsible for 'the highest *adat*', which is characterized as 'the religion from beneath' and 'comes from [...] the base of heaven, surfacing from the deep water-pool' (p. 149) – indicating once again a continuity between upper- and underworld. For life on earth to be possible, blessings must come from both of these spheres. The heavenly blessings arrive through the agency of the ancestors, deities with whom men ideally merge after death (p. 174). Women, on the other hand, merge with the earthly gods in *pabisuan*, and Torijene is also ancestral to the Mamasa. This makes both sources of blessing ancestral; and the opposition between upper- and underworld resolves into one between male and female ancestors.

In Chapter 12 the focus switches to the headhunting ritual, which the author analyses as a thanksgiving ritual for men, parallel to the *pabisuan* thanksgiving performed by women. Headhunting, though now no longer practiced, is said to release men from their femininity and, as a sign of their masculinity and courage, increase their potency (p. 191). Yet since the head of a slave presented to the headhunters would often suffice, I wonder whether this *rite de passage* aspect, however frequently emphasized in the literature, is not in fact a secondary feature of the ritual. The hunted head (and here Buijs cites Kenneth George) is 'an object in the moral traffic of exchange between human and spirit worlds'. In Mamasa the spirits concerned are those of the wilderness, and obtaining their blessings is probably the primary reason for going on a headhunting raid. Since the trophy comes from outside the community (that is, from the wilderness), it is proof of the spirits' favour and a

sign of their blessing on the community (pp. 192-3, 196). At the same time, the ritual is a thanksgiving for that blessing.

Chapter 13 details some of the changes that have taken place in Mamasa rituals since the area was opened up and Christianity began to make headway. In essence, the trend is to maintain cultural aspects but to eliminate the gods and spirits. Thus the women's dance in the forest that is part of *pabisuan* no longer takes place in or near a banyan tree in the forest, but rather in the village itself. Deities of the wilderness have disappeared as sources of blessing, diminishing the position of women as mediators with them. This has shifted the focus to masculine aspects and to the position and status of the nobility and of heaven, a shift that was perhaps already underway before the advent of Christian influence (pp. 210-11, 227).

The final chapter summarizes the arguments presented in the book, concluding that the wilderness has given way to heaven and that the focus of the rituals is now on the community and the *adat* house. Heaven and social status now receive people's full attention, leading to inflation in (especially) funerary rituals, in which the 'status of the deceased and his family is worshipped' (p. 229).

Overall, *Powers of blessing from the wilderness and from heaven* gives us valuable data on and insights into Mamasa rituals as they used to be performed, and the changes they have undergone. This usefulness could have been enhanced had the author used more comparative material from elsewhere in Indonesia and Southeast Asia. Although the Leiden idea of Indonesia as a Field of Anthropological Study is mentioned several times in the book, full use is not made here of the ethnographic comparison which is implied in this concept, and which would have enriched the analysis. The sexual 'play' in the ricefield has parallels elsewhere in the region, as do the bisexuality (or sexual neutrality) of the *toburake* (pp. 142-7), the story of the maiden who emerges from a length of bamboo (p. 150), and the association between rainbow and boat (p. 158) – to name but a few Mamasa manifestations of widespread Indonesian cultural motifs. This and the other criticisms made above, however, are ultimately minor quibbles, and as it stands the book will be a much-appreciated resource for future scholars of the Toraja region.

References

- Schärer, H.
1963 *Ngaju religion; The conception of God among a South Borneo people*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff. [KITLV Translation Series, 6.]
- Wessing, Robert
2006 'Symbolic animals in the land between the waters; Markers of place and transition', *Asian Folklore Studies* 65:205-39.

Jamie S. Davidson, *From rebellion to riots; Collective violence on Indonesian Borneo*. Madison, Wisconsin: The University of Wisconsin Press, 2008, xviii + 287 pp. ISBN 0299225841. Price USD 24.95 (paperback); 0299225803, USD 60.00 (hardback).

VICTOR T. KING
University of Leeds
v.t.king@leeds.ac.uk

Davidson presents a meticulously researched politico-historical analysis of the West Kalimantan riots from 1967 to 2001. From being a backwater of the Indonesian republic, the province gained an unenviable reputation for its ethnic strife, the horrific massacre of innocent civilians and the displacement of large numbers of long-established migrants. How could communities which had lived in relative peace for a long period of time suddenly fall upon one another in such a merciless and violent way? Indonesia specialists have waited a long time for such a thorough, fine-grained analysis of the 'micro-processes' underlying the origins, persistence, characteristics and transformations of ethnic violence in West Kalimantan.

Davidson's work began in the summer of 1996 when he enrolled for postgraduate studies at the University of Washington under the tutelage of Daniel Lev. Davidson's acknowledgements of those who gave him advice and guidance during the long period of gestation from the doctoral dissertation to the completion of the book read like a Who's Who of prominent scholars of Indonesia. The volume also incorporates material already published between 2002 and 2005 on the 'lineages', 'politics' and 'decentralization' of 'regional violence'.

His main investigation commences with the anti-Chinese pogroms of late 1967, considers the relatively small-scale Dayak-Madurese clashes which occurred sporadically from the late 1960s into the 1970s and 1980s, addresses the Dayak-Madurese violence of early 1997 in Sambas and Pontianak districts, the anti-Madurese attacks by local Malays and Dayaks in early 1999, and the further round of anti-Madurese violence perpetrated primarily by Malays in Pontianak in October 2000 and June 2001.

Davidson marshals an impressive range of primary materials. This is one of the great strengths of the study. Important sources of information include internal army reports, papers from the private collection of Oevaang Oeray (a leading figure in the Daya[k] Unity Party and a former provincial Governor), a spread of other central and regional government documents, newspapers, magazines and news services, and Davidson's own interview and field material.

A consistent theme is the inadequacy of monocausal, deterministic, essentialist, non-diachronic explanations of mass violence. Instead Davidson urges

a historically contextualised and contingent, multidimensional perspective and, in comparative mode, draws attention to the difficulties of understanding mass violence in terms of an all-encompassing explanatory framework. Thus he argues that the sustained non-separatist bloodletting experienced in West Kalimantan is different in character and inspiration from the separatist conflicts in Aceh, East Timor and Papua and the ethno-religious strife in the Moluccas and Central Sulawesi. Davidson also uses the case-study method to cast light on other far-flung examples of violence in Calcutta, Kano and Karachi.

In his search for the origins of ethnic violence in West Borneo, he goes back to Dutch colonial policies and their construction of distinct ethnicities. He also examines the significance of the formal emergence and development of a pan-Dayak identity with the founding of the Daya[k] Unity Party by educated Christian Dayaks in 1946. More importantly he focuses on New Order policies from 1966 onward, and on the consequences for outer island populations of what he calls 'coercive state-building' and the associated 'politicization of ethnicity' in the context of centrally-directed technocratic development (p. 3). A critical period in the post-independence history of West Kalimantan was the regime's counter-insurgency campaign in Borneo in the aftermath of Confrontation. The military-sponsored anti-Chinese campaign in West Kalimantan in late 1967 came together with the ambitions of members of the Dayak political elite in Pontianak. The emerging Dayak consciousness intensified from the early 1980s, and this in turn provoked the mobilization of the Malay political elite and the strengthening of Malay identity.

Davidson has made a significant contribution to the literature on mass violence in Indonesia and more widely, and provided a finely crafted study of an important dimension of the post-colonial history of West Borneo. What he seems not to have done is to exploit, or even refer to, the substantial literature on peasant unrest. Most, if not all of the structural and processual issues which Davidson interrogates in the literature on the politics of violence is there in the work of students of peasant rebellion, including the multidimensional character of unrest, variations in time and space, relations between elites and masses, deprivation of various kinds, ethnic conflict, political mobilization, cultural dissonance, contingent events and critical junctures. But aside from this omission and a few minor typographical errors, this is a very fine piece of scholarship on a relatively neglected part of Indonesia.

Kees van Dijk, *The Netherlands Indies and the Great War, 1914-1918*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2007, xiii + 674 pp. [Verhandelungen 254.] ISBN 9789067183086. Price: EUR 39.50 (paperback).

JAAP ANTEN

Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies (KITLV)

anten@kitlv.nl

Modern books on the Kingdom of the Netherlands during the Great War concentrate on the Netherlands. Here, finally, is one dealing with the 85 per cent of the inhabitants of that kingdom who lived in the East Indies.

The Netherlands Indies and the Great War is, besides a presentation of Van Dijk's own research, a highly useful integration of the many existing publications that touch on the subject to a greater or lesser extent. Inevitably, Van Dijk is not able to fill all of the lacunae that become apparent when the existing literature is summarized in this way. His research concentrates on the influence of the war on the economy, and on the nationalist movement. His main historical sources are documents produced by the Dutch colonial authorities, together with contemporary publications in the Dutch and colonial press.

Page after page, Van Dijk shows in detail how economic decline generates social tension. His style of writing consists of describing how European, Indonesian, Chinese, and Indo-European groups and movements reacted to each other, and to the changing circumstances. This produces a dynamic and lively book, the pleasure of reading which is augmented by Van Dijk's mild humour and sense of irony.

The disadvantage of this action/reaction approach is that it can lead to an incomplete account of processes involving governance and the state. One example must suffice. Van Dijk devotes a whole chapter to the Dutch navy on the eve of the Great War. In it he describes the plan of the State Commission of 1912 to defend the archipelago primarily using battleships (a plan which was to prove impracticable after war broke out.) Van Dijk devotes much space to agitation by the association *Onze Vloot* (Our Fleet) in support of this plan, thereby giving the impression that the call for a strong navy was essentially a propaganda campaign orchestrated by this organization. Although mention is made of the role of the Dutch politician Hendrik Colijn, what is missing here is the fact that is that the State Commission of 1912 was both constructed and dominated by Colijn as Minister of War and of the Navy. The Dutch Prime Minister and Minister of Colonies also had seats in the commission, as mentioned by Henri Beunders in his book *Weg met de Vlootwet* (Bergen: Octavo, 1984). The State Commission of 1912 defined military strategy in the Netherlands East Indies for the next thirty years. That strategy was directed against Japan, the land considered to be the most likely enemy. It was the

result of a secret, cool analysis of the political and military balance of power in Asia, and should not be confused with a result of agitation by the press or by Onze Vloot.

A later chapter deals with the challenge of maintaining neutrality at sea during the first two years of the war. In 1914 and 1915, everything was precarious. The moment the Netherlands were no longer neutral, the colony would lose its neutrality too. Conversely, any blunder which compromised the neutrality of the Netherlands Indies with respect to Germany or Great Britain could mean war for the motherland.

Although much attention is devoted in this book to the army, too little is said about its mobilization. This could have been an excellent opportunity to destroy the lasting misapprehension that the KNIL (Royal Netherlands Indies Army) was only a 'police army'. In reality, it was also intended to defend Java against any foreign invasion. While the KNIL was certainly poorly equipped to face a foreign enemy, the same was also true of the Dutch army in the Netherlands itself.

Van Dijk shows that the weakness of the KNIL was well known. In 1915 the idea of transforming it into a big indigenous army based on conscription – a people's army – became a major political issue. Although this idea had already been mooted for many years in military circles, during the First World War it also attracted widespread popular support, effectively as an alternative to the strategy of 1912 according to which the colony was to be defended mainly by sea power. 'Indië Weerbaar', as the movement in support of a big conscript army was called, runs like a red thread through the book. If the archipelago was defended by its own inhabitants, some reasoned, Indonesians would control the ultimate instrument of colonial power, and independence would be only a matter of time.

How European, Chinese and especially Indonesian organizations reacted to Indië Weerbaar is described in excellent detail by Van Dijk. Boedi Oetomo, an important early nationalist organization, decided after internal discussion to support it. The Muslim movement Sarekat Islam also backed it for a long time. In both organizations, however, the leadership was much more aware of the potential political gains involved than was the rank and file, and Indië Weerbaar never attracted mass support among the population at large. As Indië Weerbaar evolved in the direction of a fund-raising institution under European leadership, the Sarekat Islam gave up its support and radicalized, triggering off an internal struggle which ended only after the war in a split between Sarekat Islam and the newly founded Indonesian Communist Party.

An important catalyst for this acceleration of Indonesian emancipation during the First World War was economic change. As Van Dijk shows, the archipelago depended heavily on maritime trade, the scope for which was

determined by the belligerent nations. After the anxious year 1914, things for a time turned out to be better than expected in this respect. The strategy of maintaining neutrality worked, and exports from the Netherlands Indies remained at reasonably high levels, particularly thanks to new markets in the British Empire and United States. As a consequence, the nationalist organizations support the government's neutrality policy.

Nevertheless, each population group had its own interests and preferences. Indigenous Indonesians – who made up most of the population of the Kingdom of the Netherlands – were mostly inclined to support Germany and Austria-Hungary, and portraits of the emperors of both nations could be seen in many houses. Britain, with its huge empire, was perceived as the biggest colonial oppressor. After Ottoman Turkey entered the war on the German side, the latter also appeared pro-Islamic. The majority of the European population in the Indies preferred the opposite camp, more out of sympathy for the French and Belgians than for the British.

In early 1917, trade took a downward turn when the naval conflict started to affect the Netherlands and its colony more strongly. In describing this development, the book suffers from some lack of structure. In Chapter 12, the reader is obliged to infer the story of the blockade from the Dutch political reactions to it; not until Chapter 13 is the root cause identified as the escalation in February 1917 (not January, as Van Dijk states) of German's submarine war against Britain. In an attempt to bring Britain to its knees, German submarines suddenly started to target both British shipping, and vessels of neutral powers trading with Britain. This led to war with the United States. By organizing convoys and by forcing the neutral states, especially the Netherlands, to continue trading with it, Britain narrowly escaped defeat. Many Dutch ships simply were taken over by the British and their allies. The resulting shipping crisis brought the Netherlands Indies to 'the brink of disaster' (p. 616).

The last year of the war, 1918, was the year of disaster. By that stage only a small proportion of the colony's exports were destined for the Netherlands, a change which proved to be permanent. Almost the only crops which could still be exported (Van Dijk describes the situation crop by crop) were those in demand in the United States. Factories came to a standstill from want of coal, and prices skyrocketed; gone were the days when the inhabitants of the Moluccan island of Saparua could hold a collection for those hit by war-poverty in the Netherlands. Supplies of imported rice, on which the Indies had come to depend, were cut off, and starvation was averted only thanks to government stockpiles, which themselves were adequate for less than a year and would have been exhausted if the armistice of 11 November 1918 had come much later.

Economic and social disruption fuelled political radicalization. A visit to

the Netherlands by members of the indigenous political elite failed to secure significant concessions. In July 1918 a Volksraad or 'People's Council' was established, but only a minority of its members represented the indigenous population, and its powers fell far short of those of a parliament: it could not, for instance, dismiss the governor-general of the colony. The climax of the social unrest came in November 1918, as Europe was experiencing the disintegration of empires, famine, and revolution. Governor-General Van Limburg Stirum, cut off by poor communications from a radicalized motherland, and uncertain whether or not parliament had been disbanded, declared that the Indies would if necessary steer a course independent from that of the Netherlands. This 'November statement' (Novemberverklaring) was applauded by the indigenous population. But when the situation eased in the Netherlands, Van Limburg Stirum's predecessor Idenburg, now Minister of Colonies, blew the whistle on him. Van Dijk sees the November statement as a very important event, and rightly so; but would history have proceeded differently if it had not been made? By that time the nationalist organizations had already put down strong roots, while organizations of European entrepreneurs had also grown during the war, and radicalized in the opposite direction.

After finishing the book, one has a comprehensive view of the development of the nationalist movement, trade, and agriculture in the Netherlands Indies during the First World War. This leads to a conclusion that may surprise even the author. In the nineteenth century, the *Jeune École* of French naval strategists proposed that the industrial revolution had rendered leading countries, particularly the British Isles, fatally vulnerable to a naval blockade, which would plunge them into economic and political crisis. *The Netherlands Indies and the Great War* is a rare comprehensive case study of the impact of such a blockade, and it supports the French view. In this respect the book makes a major contribution to international maritime history.

As a study of the impact of the war on the Indies, however, it is handicapped by insufficient attention to the workings of the colonial state (as opposed to political movements), and by the fact that although it begins with a useful overview of the condition of the colony on the eve of the war, there is no corresponding overview at the end. Adding such a second snapshot, enabling the reader to draw up the balance of the changes during the war years, would have added perhaps two more chapters to the existing 22. In addition, a good introduction to the organization of the Indies government would have made the book more accessible to non-Indonesia specialists.

After reading *The Netherlands Indies and the Great War*, one realizes how similar the impact of the war was on the Indies as on the Netherlands itself – and, to a somewhat lesser extent, on Europe as a whole. Van Dijk's book – which is a great achievement, and which ought to be translated in Dutch –

highlights the need of a comparative integrated study of the Kingdom of the Netherlands during the First World War (like that of L. de Jong on the Second) that encompasses both the Netherlands and its colonies.

Linda España-Maram, *Creating masculinity in Los Angeles' Little Manila; Working-class Filipinos and popular culture, 1920s-1950s*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2006, 288 pp. ISBN 0231115938. Price: USD 26.50 (paperback).

JOHN D. BLANCO

University of California, San Diego

jdblanc@ucsd.edu

In the field of ethnic US literature and history, Carlos Bulosan's *America is in the heart* (1943) stands out as one of the standard reference texts for the study of Philippine and Asian-American history and cultural production. Yet it also appears as an anomaly: set apart from other works of the period, given the background of its author (an uneducated, working-class Filipino migrant labourer and later journalist for the radical press) as well as the relative lack of accessible works documenting similar experiences by other Filipino or Asian migrant labourers. In many ways, the fate of *America is in the Heart* reflects our amnesia regarding the 'lost generation' of aging bachelors (*manongs*) Bulosan's book portrays: a significant population of unskilled or semiskilled workers, mostly male, emigrating to the US in order to escape the poverty of their home country, which had become a US colony after 1898. They were prohibited from owning land, deprived of the rights of citizenship, forbidden from marrying whites, restricted to the lowest paid forms of labour (primarily agricultural stoop labor and domestic service); and often the victims of segregation and race riots. These Filipinos would nevertheless participate in the birth and growth of agricultural and industrial unions on the West Coast. Yet after World War II, the postwar independence of the Philippine Republic (1946), and the US targeting of a wholly different profile of immigrants from the Philippines after 1965, even this accomplishment appeared as the outdated relic of a past that bore no meaningful relation to the present.

The immediate contribution of Linda España-Maram's *Creating masculinity in Los Angeles' Little Manila* is the retrieval of this lost generation. Yet beyond merely providing an historical backdrop to the likes of Bulosan, España-Maram combines an exhaustive study of oral transcripts from the 1930s (many of them previously unused), meticulous reading of Philippine

newspapers published in the US, and an overarching familiarity with US critical race theory, cultural studies, and post-colonial Philippine nationalist historiography, to recreate and reflect on the sites and events that produced ideas of race, gender, cultural belonging/exclusion, and socioeconomic mobility, for the *manong* generation. Building on pioneering US studies of race by Robin Kelley, George Sánchez, George Lipsitz, and David Roediger, as well as studies on questions of colonial subjection and post-colonial citizenship by C.L.R. Rames, Stuart Hall, and Renato Constantino, the book 'examines how these workers negotiated an identity based on youth, ethnicity, and heterosexual masculinity through the aesthetics and public performance of brown bodies in leisure centres that catered to Filipino patrons and how these areas subsequently came to be contested terrains with the dominant society' (p. 7). Chapters 2-4 focus primarily on specific leisure sites – the gambling dens of L.A.'s Chinatown, the boxing arena, the taxi dance hall – that comprised a kind of public sphere for Filipinos, who were excluded from mainstream society by their anomalous status as at once 'nationals', 'aliens', and racialized subjects. By contrast, Chapters 1 and 5 develop a broad overview of the economic and institutional determinants of Philippine working-class bachelor society – specifically, their insertion into certain largely unskilled labour professions (primarily agriculture and domestic service), and into the US military during World War II.

Despite its primary value as a work of historiography, *Creating masculinity* clearly distinguishes itself from the previous generation of scholarship's tendency to frame the anomalous status and popular culture of Philippine migrant workers as reflective of either a product of 'colonial (mis-) education', or, conversely, a radical ethnic minority proto-nationalism. In a remarkable synthesis of interviews, statistics, and historical narrative, España-Maram's book resonates strongly with the contributions of historical sociology in the past two decades by Lisa Lowe (on comparative Asian US racialization), Yen Le Espiritu (on differential inclusion), and Filomeno Aguilar (on the folklorization of colonial structures) by highlighting the correspondence between the anomalous status of Filipino/Filipina migrants as US 'nationals', and their contradictory forms of agency and empowerment. These expressions ranged from gambling, dandyism, and consumerism to the ambiguous legacy of joining the US armed forces to fight the Japanese in the Pacific War. Finally, España-Maram's study paves the way for a larger, provocative theoretical elaboration (which remains implicit rather than explicit in the work) on the critical and reflective aspects of popular culture and aesthetic self-fashioning, in which the reality of socioeconomic immobility for the overwhelming majority became inextricably tied to the relentless attempt to imagine a redeemed life otherwise.

Renate Carstens, *Durch Asien im Horizont des Goethekreises; Neue Facetten im Wirken Goethes*. [Schriften zur Kulturwissenschaft, 71.] Hamburg: Verlag Dr. Kovač, 2008, 726 pp. ISBN 9783830036562. Price: EURO 98.00 (paperback).

EDWIN WIERINGA

University of Cologne
ewiering@uni-koeln.de

This book has all the trappings of a serious, scholarly tome. It is a doorstop-sized volume, and its ambitious title promises that it will shed new light on certain aspects concerning Goethe and Asia. Its author, Renate Eisengarter (born in 1938), after 1987 Carstens, served from 1976 as (senior) lecturer of Indonesian at the University of Jena in East Germany. Yet the book is not one that can be recommended to academic readers. One should have thought that every single fact is already known about Johann Wolfgang von Goethe (1749-1832), conventionally considered Germany's Olympian genius, but apparently this is not the case: Carstens opens her book with her discovery of the fact that Goethe in his role as president of the 'Sozietät für die gesammte (gesamte) Mineralogie zu Jena' had been appointed on 21 December 1826 as honorary member of the Batavian Society of Arts and Sciences (p. 13). Carstens proudly recounts that this incident had hitherto been unknown to Goethe experts, and was even left unrecorded in the fact-studded multi-volume work describing Goethe's day-to-day life (*Goethes Leben von Tag zu Tag*). This tiny detail may seem to most of us a mere triviality, but what follows is an overextended 'essay' or rather a rambling, anecdotal travel account on all possible things Asian, loosely connected to Goethe and his acolytes.

For example, Goethe's perusal of secondary literature on Indonesian affairs sparks off many 'marginalia' ('Marginalien') on such topics as Javanese history, Javanese marriage ceremonies, the Chinese minority in Indonesia, the history of Batavia/Jakarta, and so on and so forth. The sole fact that Goethe was acquainted with a member of the von Imhoff family, which had connections with the Far East, is reason enough for Carstens to provide an excruciatingly detailed list, seven pages long (68-74), of greetings used by Goethe in letters to this family in order to document their relationship: 'Der Schwester einen guten Morgen', 'Grüßen Sie die Imhof und die kleine', 'Grüße Fritzgen und die Imhof und denct an mich', and many other variations flowing from the pen of the great writer. Goethe's chapter on Marco Polo in his 'West-Östlicher Divan' gives rise to a long-winded description of the Silk Route and all kinds of travel information on Asia.

In the publisher's catalogue there is a long list of keywords for this book, which may be helpful for the would-be reader, including of course Goethe

and the Batavian Society of Arts and Sciences, but also Friedrich von Schiller, Georg Lenz, Georg Forster, Johann Friedrich Blumenbach, Alexander von Humboldt, Wilhelm von Humboldt, Philipp Franz von Siebold, Adelbert von Chamisso, (Grand) Duke Karl August, Ernst Haeckel, Heinrich Seemann, Asian cultural history, Indonesian history, Batavia, Jakarta, Bogor, Singapore, China, Mongolia, Central Asia, Siberia, Tatarstan, Russia, the Caucasus, the Svaneti region of the Caucasus (Georgia), the Mongol invasion, the Silk Road, Genghis Khan, Marco Polo, Tamerlane, the saga of the Argonauts, Medea, Jason, Prometheus, and Amirani.

The author herself is very much present in this narrative: she regularly interweaves her account with extracts from her own travel diaries, regardless of their relevance to the subject. Who needs to know that she spent the night at Hotel Pinang Sari in Banyuwangi in August 1993, or that she stayed in Kuta at the Hotel Agung Beach Cottages from 31 August-2 September 1993 (p. 236)? In August 1993 she was in Malang, about which she writes: 'Wir übernachteten in Malang im Studentenwohnheim an der Universität. Am folgenden Tag diskutieren wir in der Hochschule in einer größeren Runde Studienprobleme in unseren beiden Ländern' (p. 52). Is there a point to this that I am missing? Colour photos on page 549 show three portraits of the author in 1995, happily smiling, with documents in the Indonesian National Library in Jakarta, but the text has another story to tell: quite bluntly she goes on and on about her negative experiences at Indonesian research institutes (pp. 548 and further).

It was Goethe who once famously wrote: 'In der Beschränkung zeigt sich erst der Meister'. In this case it is a gratuitous remark to say that less would have been more. This self-indulgent 'vanity product' has been published at the reader's expense: a complete waste of money.

James T. Collins, *Bahasa Sanskerta dan Bahasa Melayu*. Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia, Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa, École Française d'Extrême-Orient, 2009, 142 pp. [Seri Naskah dan Dokumen Nusantara XXVII.] ISBN 9789799101419. Price: IDR 12,500 (paperback).

ARLO GRIFFITHS
École française d'Extrême-Orient, Jakarta
arlo.griffiths@efeo.net

As a fresh arrival in Indonesia and Nusantara studies, I greatly enjoyed reading this thin but very informative book. The author himself does not cease to emphasize that the topic is too large to be treated exhaustively by one scholar, and certainly not in less than 100 printed pages. What we get instead of an exhaustive treatment is a rich and wide-ranging, very personal set of observations, showing a justly critical engagement with the state of linguistics and philology in the Malay world – although the audience addressed and the scholarship with which Collins engages is most often specifically Malaysian.

The author works with an unusually – but still justifiably – broad definition of ‘Sanskrit’, comprising such multifarious things South Asian as languages from Old, Middle, and New Indo-Aryan through Dravidian; the predominant (*brāhmī*-derived) syllabic Indic writing system; and even the influence of colonial British India on the Malay world and the beginnings of Malay studies. The book’s principal chapters offer a history of research, a discussion of Indic writing systems in the archipelago, and a treatment of Indic elements in the Malay lexicon. It is attractively illustrated, and almost free of typos.

Collins has effectively undercut most inroads for criticism by his numerous – to my taste too numerous – disclaimers concerning what he doesn’t and cannot offer. Nevertheless, several critical observations can be made. I take the chance to do so because the book deserves to be republished in a more internationally accessible language, and in that case, the opportunity to make improvements should not be missed.

A book dealing with Sanskrit will be expected by Sanskritists to pay attention to the placement of diacritics, but it is really for the sake of non-Sanskritists that they must be used properly. Collins uses them inconsistently (for example, p. 37, note 2). Where they are entirely lacking, this can yield misleading data such as ‘*ap* “memperoleh [to obtain, AG]”’ (p. 42), where we should have *āp* (*ap*, with short *a*, is a different word altogether). Several of the ‘Sanskrit words in Malay inscriptions of the 7th century’ in Table 1 (p. 93) may have been misrepresented (for example, *bhakti-* for *bhakti-*; *mūlā-* for *mūla-*). It is not clear in this table why some stems are hyphenated, while others are not, although perhaps the hyphens here denote extraction from compounds. A (part of a) sentence may have disappeared in printing on page 41, where the form *śaṇṇāṃ* (correct: *śaṇṇāṃ*) is definitely not the genitive of *śavva* (which itself does not mean ‘situ [there, AG]’ but ‘left’; *śaṇṇāṃ* belongs to *ṣaṭ* ‘six’). It is unclear here whether the errors are Bopp’s or Collins’s. Regarding page 94, note that *tathāpi* already functions as a concessive element in Sanskrit, so Collins’ point about Malay *tetapi* is obscure. There are also outdated transliterations which it is high time to purge once and for all from the representation of Sanskrit data in Southeast Asian studies: *sh* for *ṣ* (37 n. 2) and *ç* for *ś* (93, Table 1; 94).

Another old and widespread misconception, which Collins unfortunately

helps to perpetuate, is the identification of Devanāgarī as ‘Sanskrit’ writing (p. 37, ‘aksara asal Sanskerta [letters based on Sanskrit, AG]’; p. 38, ‘aksara ... Sanskerta [Sanskrit letters, AG]’, with figure containing Devanāgarī akṣaras). Related to this is the erroneous attribution of Thai writing to the northern branch of *brāhmī*-derived scripts, which branch in turn is wrongly equated with Devanāgarī (p. 69, Figure 21; p. 72, note 1). Collins here refers to an evidently unreliable secondary source. This illustrates his generally heavy bibliographic reliance on secondary, even tertiary sources, which are not always up-to-date and are sometimes unreliable. Consultation of the important contributions to the sociolinguistic history of Sanskrit in South and Southeast Asia by S. Pollock (most recently in *The language of the Gods in the world of Men*, 2006) would have made Collins’ views significantly more nuanced. It further seems to me that Collins is not entirely fair in his treatment of the term ‘Archipelago Sanskrit’ (pp. 107, 121), which, I believe, had no racist implications when it was introduced; those who used it did not yet have access to the wealth of data on non-Pāṇinian registers of Sanskrit from India itself, which has been brought to scholars’ attention only in recent years, through the works of T. Oberlies (*A grammar of epic Sanskrit*, 2003), D. Goodall (introduction to *The Parākhyantra*, 2004) and others. Quite a bit has happened in Indology since the work of J. Gonda (1952; the 1971 second edition is not consistently used and is absent from the bibliography) and J. Schoterman (1979, 1981)!

Also questionable is that Collins refers only to G.E. Marissov (p. 48, note 1), at the expense of fundamental contributions by K. Bhattacharya, J. Filliozat and C. Jacques, concerning (the dating of) the oldest Sanskrit document of Southeast Asia, the Vo-canh inscription, probably emanating from the very beginnings of Campā. Speaking of Campā, the oldest document in any Austronesian language (the Old Cam Dong-yen-chau inscription, C. 174) would have deserved mention, as would, despite its foibles, the 1999 monograph *From ancient Cham to modern dialects* by G. Thurgood. In view of the frequent (and in themselves welcome!) references to other comparative data, for example, from the Philippines, the neglect of Campā really does seem regrettable – more so than the few references and disclaimers about Campā that suddenly appear at the end of the book (p. 120, note 2; p. 122) reveal. This is especially so because Cam data, in my view, require correction of such statements as ‘Tradisi keberaksaraan Melayu ini bermula pada tahun 683 [This Malay tradition of the use of writing began in the year 683]’ (page 65, note 1), and are also pertinent to the next issue I would like to discuss.

I regretted the lack of focus in this book on the *system* of Indic writing. It seems to me that the repeated claim (pp. 58, 62) concerning local innovations upon the system received from India should have been backed up with stronger evidence than the sole reference to the use of the *anusvāra* sign *m̐* for

word-final /ŋ/, that is *ṇ*, which to my mind is more likely to reflect uses of the sign known in ancient India itself (in manuscripts and inscriptions, but absent from 'standard' treatments of Sanskrit) than to be an Old Malay innovation. (The usage in any case also occurs in Old Cam epigraphy.) In fact, it seems to me that unmodified Indic writing was extraordinarily well suited to the representation of Old Malay. A comparative table of phoneme inventories and writing systems would have clearly illustrated that there is precious little in Malay phonology that finds no easy representation in Indic writing. The main innovation that has occurred in several archipelago descendants of Indic writing is the drastic reduction of the number of signs in use. As far as I can see it is only in a quote from Reid, concerning Philippine writing (p. 65), that this book gives us any indication of the number of signs used in any Nusantara writing system, namely 17. That this implies a reduction of more than 50 per cent *vis-à-vis* most Indic writing systems, or that a similar (although significantly more complex) innovation has occurred in India itself (in Tamil writing), remains unmentioned.

There are many other aspects of this book that can be debated at some length, but this is not the place. I fervently hope that Collins will rise to the challenge and produce a new edition of his work, which does not require fundamental revision but can be improved in significant ways. This delightful work certainly deserves it.

Victoria M. Clara van Groenendael, *Jaranan; The horse dance and trance in East Java*. [Translated by Maria J.L. van Yperen.] Leiden: KITLV Press, 2008, xiv + 293 pp. [Verhandelingen 252.] ISBN 9789067183062. Price: EUR 39.90 (paperback).

DICK VAN DER MEIJ
Centre for the Study of Religion and Culture
State Islamic University, Jakarta
Dickvdm2005@yahoo.com

Politics and the arts enjoy a long and complicated relationship in post-independence Indonesia. Local cultures were in fashion under one administration, were used for political purposes under another, and were discouraged under yet another. The link between politics and the Javanese shadow play (*wayang*) and many other kinds of performing arts in the archipelago has become an ingrained characteristic of Indonesian performing art forms and practices. This became crystal clear last year when a Malaysian tourist campaign featuring

the East Javanese Reyog Ponorogo horse dance caused uproar in Indonesia, and politicians and others used and misused this tumult each for their own ends. Many Indonesians felt that Malaysia had appropriated an Indonesian art form for its own commercial and tourism needs, even though the *reyog* is undeniably part of the culture of the Javanese population of Malaysia. The commotion even triggered the formation of two Excellent Persons Groups (EPG), one in Indonesia and one in Malaysia, to discuss ways to improve relations between the two countries. The issue is still heatedly contended, as becomes clear every time the EPG groups meet in a plenary session with the scholarly and cultural elite of Jakarta.

This uproar of emotions can be explained largely by the history of the way Soeharto's New Order government consistently tried to appropriate performing arts for its own purposes. This history of political art's appropriation is highly useful to our understanding of demagoguery in Indonesia and in the world in general, and this is precisely why the book under review is interesting and important.

The book describes in great detail the East Javanese *jaranan* horse dance in the mid-1980s and early 1990s, and is based on fieldwork that the author conducted in the Kediri area of East Java. The book was actually finished in 1991 but unfortunately the manuscript was lost. In 1992, however, the author was able to revisit East Java and the book has profited from the additional insights gained during this trip. The fact that the author undertook to write the book a second time deserves our utmost admiration. I think not many of us would have such perseverance.

The book is the result of carefully executed fieldwork. We seldom get the chance to closely follow an anthropologist at work, and this book gives us interesting insights into the way the author grew into the subject. Through the many quotes from her fieldwork notes, we see how she went about her work. Apart from being a study of the *jaranan*, then, it is also a personal record of the author herself; the book ends with a nice picture of Victoria with her main informant, who was also the leader of the horse dance group she studied, the late Mr Samboyo Sukiman in Mojoroto, Kediri.

At the time the research for this book was conducted, the influence of Jakarta as the centre of power was keenly felt. Under Soeharto's New Order government, local performing arts were encouraged to strengthen local culture within the larger Indonesian picture, while on the other hand they were used and misappropriated for the dissemination of centralized notions of development and modernity which often did not coincide with local notions. At present, some ten years after the implementation of regional autonomy, regional governments make every effort to 'revitalize' (an elastic term often used for renovation, innovation and re-creation) local forms of performing arts with or without active support from the central government in Jakarta.

In this light, the book is a valuable document on a significant performing folk art form in East Java prior to decentralization. There is one clear difference between the roles of 'traditional artists' under the New Order, as described by Clara van Groenendael, and their role at present. In Soeharto's time, they were given a role in the realization of the government-planned development of Indonesia, whereas at present they are given a role in the constitution of regional cultural prestige. Rather than having a role in the creation of an *Indonesian* cultural entity, they are now appropriated for *regional* cultural identity, sometimes to the chagrin of the central government.

During the fieldwork period the Samboyo Putro horse dance group was the most popular group in the Kediri area of East Java, and the central question in the book is what it was that was responsible for the group's success at a time when this traditional art form was generally in decline. It appears that Samboyo Putro successfully combined the traditional elements of improvisation, trance and associated rituals while modernizing the performances by introducing conformity with prevailing aesthetic norms for props, costumes and presentation. The inclusion of a narrator/singer (*dhalang*) and a female singer also helped ensure its popularity. However, the traditional purpose of the performances and the trance inherent in it to seek contact with supernatural powers and deceased ancestors was (more or less) relinquished and replaced by encouraging a more active role for the audience. Samboyo thus managed to attune his performances to changing times while managing not to sever all links with the past, and by doing so was able to avoid alienating his audience. That Samboyo was also able to perform for national (Independence Day) and local governmental and political party festivities may have added to his success, as may have his job as a police officer and his membership of the Golkar political party. Social, political and community functions are usually closely connected in Indonesia, as continues to be the case in regional settings as well. The role of the individual in performing arts continuity is also important here. When Samboyo died, the group declined and is now not as popular as it used to be.

The book is replete with casual insights of a significance reaching far beyond the original subject. Especially for people concerned with the study of theatrical events in the Indonesian archipelago, these insights will be useful for further research. One such observation is that the author had never known the Samboyo Putro group to rehearse. 'As in the wayang theatre, it is true that every horse dance performance should be regarded up to a point as the dress rehearsal for the next performance' (p. 48). This is a crucial insight, and also explains a wide variety of other theatrical practices in Indonesia. Another observation is: 'Local and national authorities seem to take scarcely any interest in the more substantial aspects of horse dances, which they summarily dismiss as being archaic (*kuna*)' (p. 75); this explains why many government

efforts to preserve local traditions out of context usually end in failure. In another observation, '[...] where the young person leaves his or her childhood behind and enters a new phase in life, for instance as a married woman (in the case of girls) or as a full member of the Muslim community (for boys)' (p. 83), the author poignantly highlights the differing role of religion for boys and for girls, or men and women for that matter. Let me quote one last observation: 'It is in fact impossible to give an unambiguous answer to the question of the significance of horse dances (p. 111)'. How very true this is, and how naive it would be to expect a clear-cut answer to a question of significance.

The book is richly illustrated with photos of performances, actors, musicians, props and such, mostly taken by the author, but also by Marije Duijker, Marijke Klokke, and Rens Heringa. It is also enlivened with clear and informative line drawings made by Hans Borkent. The book itself is an English translation of the Dutch original made by Maria J.L. van Yperen, who has, like the author, done an excellent job.

The book pays detailed attention to rituals, trance, and the specifics of the performances. The author defines trance as 'a mental state, induced by a variety of factors, which creates a distance between the person concerned and his surroundings and now renders him totally self-absorbed, now produces exceptional or abnormal behaviour, of which he would be incapable in his normal state and which gives him a sense of liberation' (p. 134). Here the author wisely leaves out the neuropsychological aspects which others include in their definitions, as this aspect belongs to the medical profession. The role of spirits and other beings from the other world, and their importance during the performances, is described sensitively and forms a crucial background to an understanding of many things Javanese, even outside performance settings.

The book offers many choreographic notes and drawings about how the various players move and interact (not for all the scenes, however), and gives the origins of the story depicted (if applicable). A CD is included with the book, with recordings of songs, exclamations, and the *dhalang*'s speeches, the texts of which are included in the book in an appendix. Translations are helpfully provided in those parts of the book where they are relevant to the description and discussion. To conclude, this is a fascinating book and a valuable addition to material available for scholars interested in folk performances, for scholars interested in the conjunction of art and local and central politics, and for anyone else interested in Javanese culture.

Paul M. Handley, *The king never smiles; A biography of Thailand's Bhumibol Adulyadej*. New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press, 2006, 499 pp. ISBN 9780300106824. Price: USD 39.95 (hardback).

JEROEN RIKKERINK

The Hague

jermaa@gmail.com

Handley's biography of the Thai King Bhumibol Adulyadej, the ninth king of the Chakri dynasty, could not have appeared at a more opportune time. Amid the political turmoil that has plagued Thailand since 2006, a clear analyses of Bhumibol's role in Thai politics is more than welcome. Paul Handley certainly is the right man for the job. He worked as a foreign correspondent in Asia for twenty years, including thirteen years in Thailand.

Handley's book is probably not only the best researched biography of King Bhumibol Adulyadej to date, but also the most comprehensive account of the Thai monarchy's involvement in Thai politics. Handley's main topic is the restoration of royal power after the abolition of the absolute monarchy in 1932. This is, in his view, 'one of the great untold stories of the 20th century'.

Any publication on the Thai royal family, and particularly on the much revered king, that does not have royal consent beforehand is bound to be controversial. The events that took place between the announcement of Handley's book and the date on which it was actually released demonstrate the great lengths to which the Thai are willing to go to protect the carefully fabricated image of their king. Before Handley's book was released, the Thai government and the palace put pressure on the publisher, Yale University Press, to stop the publication from ever appearing. Leading Thai academics spoke out and criticized the book before anyone had the chance to read it. Press websites reporting on the book, and Amazon.com, which advertised it, were blocked, and the book itself was forbidden in Thailand. When asked by reporters about the Thai efforts to prevent the publication, a spokesman from the Thai embassy in Washington responded: 'You can't criticize the King because there is nothing to criticize him about'.

This last statement helps to explain the mood of panic in Thai royal and government circles. A carefully crafted and closely guarded saintly image of King Bhumibol that has been fed to the Thai for decades, and has to be protected at all costs. The king has been marketed as a peacemaker, a guardian of democratic freedom, and a protector of the Thai people against corrupt politicians and western (un-Thai) evils such as communism, capitalism and neocolonialism. The king's numerous rural development projects earned him the nickname 'developer king'. In slickly produced short propaganda

films with which the Thai are bombarded in cinemas, on TV in shopping centres, and on public transport, Bhumibol can be seen directing aid efforts and discussing agricultural improvement with officials and farmers. The larger-than-life, even god-like image of the king is closely guarded by strictly enforced laws of *lèse majesté*. For Thai it is almost impossible to be critical of the monarchy. Academic publications usually echo the official royal discourse and avoid sensitive issues. The tone used in the Thai press when reporting on the royal family borders on the ridiculous. Foreign journalists, for their part, rarely attempt to deconstruct the royal imagery. Bangkok-based BBC journalist Jonathan Head, in a lecture given at the Foreign Correspondence Club of Thailand, once stated: 'If I write about the king in the same way as Thai journalists do, they will laugh at me in London. To get any accurate information however is next to impossible, so most of the time I chose to ignore the subject'. Despite Mr. Head's careful approach, he became the object of an allegation of *lèse majesté* in April 2008.

With the publication of *The king never smiles*, some of the carefully created and maintained myths about Bhumibol are beginning to come undone. Handley has examined aspects of the Thai monarchy that until now had not been the subject of scrutiny. Bhumibol's family and private life take up a fair portion of the book. For royalty-watchers and those with an interest in the Chakri family affairs, these pages probably contain nothing new. Handley is at his best, however, when he describes how the mythology surrounding Bhumibol's reign was constructed by courtiers. The Royal spin-doctors' success story is truly remarkable, and make an interesting read for historians as well as for PR and marketing specialists. Not only did the court manage to portray the king as the Father of the Nation, with a deep concern for his people, but also as a multitalented man who excels in nearly every endeavour he takes up, be it science, sports, boatbuilding or playing the saxophone. By revealing the political agenda behind this campaign, Handley succeeds in dismantling most of the royal myths. Controversial and interesting are the sections that deal with the monarch's role in Thai politics. Contrary to popular belief, the king has intervened in politics on a regular basis, and usually not on the side of the good guys. Most serious is the charge that a partnership existed between the palace and a series of corrupt military-led regimes during the 1960s and 70s. The king's support for increasingly brutal counterinsurgency operations and right-wing vigilante groups against an exaggerated communist threat during this period further helps to undermine Bhumibol's image of political neutrality. Handley concludes that by demanding a central role for the monarchy and systematically downplaying the importance of democracy and constitutional rule, Bhumibol obstructed political reform and impeded the transformation of Thailand into a modern nation-state. The resulting instability in the Thai political system is still evident today. The political unrest and street violence

that has engulfed Thailand since the military staged a royally-backed coup to overthrow the government of Prime Minister Thaksin Shinawatra in September 2006 speaks for itself. Mystery surrounds the involvement of the king in these recent events. Officially Bhumibol maintains a neutral stance, but readers of Paul Handley's biography know better. This book is a 'must read' for reporters, diplomats, and anyone else with an interest in Thai history and current affairs.

Holger Jebens, *Kago und kastom; Zum Verhältnis von kultureller Fremd- und Selbstwahrnehmung in West New Britain (Papua-Neuguinea)*. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 2007, 256 pp. ISBN 9783170199460. Price: EUR 38.00 (paperback).

MENNO HEKKER

The Hague

m.hekker@hetnet.nl

Sometimes an anthropologist has the opportunity to compare his own observations with those of a fellow anthropologist who visited the same society at an earlier date. Sometimes he even meets the same people who were interviewed by his predecessor when they were younger. Not only is the anthropologist then in a position to compare his own observations with those of his predecessor, his or her informants can also look back on and reinterpret their own past. This is the subject of Jebens' book. More specifically, his topic is the observation of self and other in cultural encounter, especially in relation to *kago* and *kastom* – that is, cargo culture and indigenous tradition. His aim is to compare indigenous and Western observation of self and other in West New Britain, Papua New Guinea, where he did his fieldwork in 1996-1997 in the village of Koimumu among the Nakanai people.

The area under study was part of German colonial territory from 1884 until 1914, when it came under Australian rule. In 1975, Papua New Guinea became independent. In 1940 a man called Batari started a cargo cult and founded the Batari movement. Its adherents believed that their ancestors would produce 'cargo' and send it to their living descendants. Europeans were accused of impeding this, so the Batari movement gave rise to resistance against Europeans.

In 1946 a new cargo cult, known as the Kivung movement, came into being. A German Roman Catholic priest, Heinrich Berger, played a rather obscure part in this movement as the leader of the Catholic Action Party,

which was in fact the Kivung movement. In 1954 an American anthropologist, Charles Valentine, entered the scene to do research on this movement. Valentine considered Berger to be the leader of the Kivung movement, and in his opinion Berger determined the nature of the relationship between the indigenous population and the colonial administration, which was one of passive resistance to all the administration's policies. The indigenous Nakanai lived like Christian Europeans, but at the same time wanted to return to a lost ancestral way of life in preparation for the Millenium. According to Valentine, Berger collected taxes among the Nakanai to finance his movement, and used Kivung to his own advantage.

In 1996, Jebens entered the field. At first the Nakanai he met denied there had been a cargo cult in 1954, and described Kivung as a Christian movement led by the missionary Berger. In their opinion its adherents had striven to live in a Christian way, and occupied themselves with economic activities like cultivating rice and copra. In the end the movement had also incorporated some cargo cult-like elements, including an expectation of the return of the ancestors offering cargo to their descendants; but this had never been Berger's intention.

The majority of Jebens' recent informants do not consider the Kivung movement as a continuation of the earlier Batari movement. Their perception of Kivung also differs from Valentine's contemporary description in that they emphasize the Christian character of the movement. They avoid using the concept of cargo cult, and in fact consider *kago* as something negative. *Kago* is what is disapproved of by the government, and stands in opposition to Christianity and economic development. It has a negative connotation, and is used primarily when referring to the beliefs and behaviour of others.

When telling stories about the Batari and Kivung movements, the Nakanai attempt to bridge the differences between the European way of living and the ancestral way of living with reference to Christianity, economic activities, and the longing for Western goods. At the same time they also criticize Europeans for not being true Christians, and complain about the gradual vanishing of their own *kastom*, their indigenous culture, to the disadvantage of their society. So, according to Jebens there are some contrary perceptions in the Nakanai mind. The stories about the Batari and Kivung movements refer to the past, but also point to the future and focus on a European way of living. The traditional mask dance, still enacted today, refers to the past and the ancestral way of living. There is no absolute distinction between the perception of the self and the perception of the other, but rather an interaction. Within the concepts of *kago* and *kastom* resides a perception of the self as well as the other. Western influences are considered negative when they result in loss of indigenous culture, and indigenous culture is considered negative when it blocks the way to a prosperous Western future.

According to Jebens, Valentine probably expected a full-blown cargo cult and therefore misinterpreted what was actually happening. In Valentine's perception the behaviour and attitudes of the Nakanai could only be the result of a secret movement driven by the missionary Berger. Jebens supposes that Valentine overinterpreted what he saw, failed to be critical toward his own observations, and led his informants to present data and stories which confirmed his own ideas.

So in the end there is an interaction between Western and non-Western cultures, and between the anthropologist and his non-Western informants. This may lead to distorted views of non-Western societies, and to anthropologists interpreting things in their own way, because they themselves are also products of their own culture and their own time. For them too, culture contact results in mutual influences on the perception of the self and the other.

Kago und kastom is written in a very anecdotal way, and this is my main point of criticism. Much attention is paid to the activities of the main characters of the play, the anthropologist Valentine and the missionary Berger. The opinions and deeds of these two key actors are not really viewed in the context of the then prevailing colonial circumstances. Description takes place at the level of small-scale events involving small numbers of people. The resulting stories may be interesting as illustrations of the main argument, but in the book they are not really used in that way. The price of Jebens' concentration on details and individuals is a partial neglect of more general patterns in human society.

As far as the theoretical argument is concerned, Jebens conflates cultural change, perception and identity with the (in my opinion quite different) topics of culture conflict and the subjective perception of the anthropologist. I am not really impressed by the idea that Western and non-Western cultures interact and influence each other's perceptions of themselves and each other. I don't think this is a novel idea, and certainly not when a systematic new analysis is lacking, as it is here. In the end culture is a theoretical construct based upon the observation and interpretation of the beholder. The relation between subject and object, between observer and observed, is a much-explored topic on which Jebens does not add a new point of view.

Jebens' book, then, presents impressions of Westerners confronted with cargo cult-like movements at different periods last century, and of the ambivalent attitudes of indigenous people towards these movements. The reader should not, however, expect full ethnographic accounts of cargo cults or new insights into culture contacts. The topic is an interesting one and Jebens disposes over valuable data, but one gets the feeling that more could have been made of it.

Lee Hock Guan and Leo Suryadinata (eds), *Language, nation and development in Southeast Asia*. Singapore, Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2007, ix + 229 pp. ISBN 9789812304827. Price: SGD 49.90 (hardback).

RENATA M. LESNER-SZWARC

Nicolaus Copernicus University, Torun

rlesner@wp.pl

This volume of nine papers, introduced by Lee Hock Guan and Leo Suryadinata, and including a keynote address by Wang Gungwu, grew out of a workshop with the same title which was held at Institute of Southeast Asian Studies in Singapore in 2003. Before the workshop, Lee and Suryadinata decided to leave out Cambodia, Laos and Brunei because it was difficult to get writers to cover those countries. The nine chapters include two on the Philippines, describing bilingual education policy and its problems (authors: Andrew Gonzalez; T. Ruanni F. Tupas); two on Indonesia, dealing respectively with the evolution of the national language (authors: Lucy R. Montolalu, Leo Suryadinata) and literature (author: Melani Budianta); one on language as a socioeconomic and political resource in multilingual Singapore (author: Eugene K.B. Tan); one on Malaysian language and ethnic education politics, (author: Lee Hock Guan); one on Myanmar's language policy in relation to ethnic diversity and nation-building (author: Kyau Yin Hlaing); one on the position of non-Thai languages in Thailand (author: Theraphan Luangthongkum); and finally a chapter on media and language policy and ideology in Vietnam (author: Ashley Carruthers).

In their papers the authors, who in all cases are superbly qualified to contribute to a volume of this sort, attempt to answer several questions (p. 2). How was the national language chosen and promoted? Who made language policy, and based on what considerations? What are the positions of languages other than the national language, both local/regional and foreign? How did the national language policy affect national integration, social cohesion, and national and ethnic identity formation? How has increasing recognition of the links between language and development influenced national language policies? What are the problems and prospects of language policies in Southeast Asia? The papers describe language policy and issues in terms of nation-building and development in post-colonial and post-independence countries of the Southeast Asian region, where cultural and linguistic diversity are universal characteristics. An important theme is the search by ethnic minorities for their own identities, particularly in relation to the role of education (Andrew Gonzalez; T. Ruanni F. Tupas; Lee Hock Guan; Kyau Yin Hlaing; Eugene K.B. Tan, Theraphan Luangthongkum) and media policy

(Ashley Carruthers). Other contributions focus on foreign languages: their influence (Lucy R. Montolalu, Leo Suryadinata; Eugene K.B. Tan), levels of competence in them (T. Ruanni F. Tupas; Lucy R. Montolalu, Leo Suryadinata; Lee Hock Guan; Kyau Yin Hlaing, Theraphan Luangthongkum), and their role (particularly that of English) in the processes of socioeconomic development and nation-building (Eugene K.B. Tan; Andrew Gonzalez). Doubts and controversies arising during the workshop are candidly reflected in many of the papers.

Although this volume was published four years after the workshop on which it is based, it has not lost its relevance. As the editors emphasize, the facts, problems and debates addressed remain germane to current situations. Contemporary Southeast Asia continues to be an interesting and attractive frame in which to study the nexus of language, nation, and development. This book can inspire other authors and help them with further analysis.

Ross H. McLeod and Andrew MacIntyre (eds), *Indonesia: Democracy and the promise of good governance*. Singapore: ISEAS, 2007, 208 pp. ISBN 9789812304667, price SGD 29.90 (paperback); 9789812304599, SGD 49.90 (hardback).

Patrick Ziegenhain, *The Indonesian parliament and democratization*. Singapore: ISEAS, 2008, 239 pp. ISBN 9789812304841, price SGD 35.90 (paperback); 9789812304858, SGD 59.90 (hardback).

HENK SCHULTE NORDHOLT

Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies (KITLV)
schultenordholt@kitlv.nl

Since 1998, Indonesia has witnessed a successful transition to electoral democracy. This positive development was, however, not accompanied by the emergence of good governance. The activists who promoted democracy in 1998 were less interested in reforming the institutions of the state. It was for this reason that in 2006, the annual 'Indonesia Update' conference in Canberra focused on the relationship between democracy and the quality of government. As the editors of *Democracy and the promise of good governance* stress in their introduction, young democracies are vulnerable if they do not meet minimal public expectations of what democracy is supposed to deliver. Effective government is a vital precondition for any democracy, but Indonesia struggles with chronic underperformance and fragmentation in its bureaucracy,

which is moreover plagued by corruption. This, in turn, is not conducive to economic growth.

Ron Duncan and Ross McLeod elaborate on the weakness of the state by explaining why national economic performance was good under the corrupt Suharto regime, and less promising after the transition to democracy. Under Suharto power was centralized, and a restricted bureaucracy and a limited number of informal rules were enough to satisfy the needs and protect the interests of the economic elite. When Suharto was gone and power no longer concentrated at the centre, formal structures proved to be weak, and once-privileged firms were vulnerable because they were no longer protected; hence a widespread reluctance to invest. It would have been interesting if the authors had elaborated on this point by addressing the analysis made by Richard Robison and Vedi Hadiz in 2004 (*Reorganising power in Indonesia; The politics of oligarchy in an age of markets*, London: RoutledgeCurzon), which emphasizes the continuity of the predatory capitalist system in Indonesia.

It is remarkable that few researchers have done actual fieldwork in the Indonesian bureaucracy. As a result we talk a lot about 'the State' without having much intimate knowledge of its internal practices. The chapter by Staffan Synnerstrom on the structure of the civil service demonstrates that reform measures have little relevance unless the civil service is also an object of reform. In 2005 Indonesia counted 3.6 million civil servants (a modest number relative to its huge population), most of whom are teachers and health care workers at the regional level. Under the New Order the civil service had become a military-style organization, in which promotion was determined by seniority instead of professionalism. Its underpaid employees were not trained to perform services, but to reproduce a culture of corruption. Because budgets are determined by fixed formulae, it is difficult to adapt the bureaucracy to new policies. Young, talented people are unlikely to feel inspired to enter the ranks of such a rigid system in order to make democracy work.

Despite these problems, remarkable improvements have been achieved. Andrew Ellis gives a good review of the changes made in the Constitution between 1999 and 2002. These changes, which will be marked by later historians as the cornerstones of Reformasi, have been accomplished without attracting much public attention. Within four years the authoritarian and integralistic New Order state was transformed into a democratic system with checks and balances and separation of powers. A crucial role was played by the committee that prepared these constitutional changes. Led by Jakob Tobing, an experienced Member of Parliament, this committee worked very hard and with a low profile to get the fundamental changes accepted by the legislature. Its great and largely unsung achievement has been to build democracy into the Constitution. At the same time, this remains an example of elite-driven reform. On a somewhat related topic is the contribution by Simon

Butt, who discusses among other things the promising start made by the new constitutional court established in 2003. Like other authors, however, Butt stresses that law enforcement is weak, and that this is due to the weakness of Indonesian state institutions.

Other chapters in this volume discuss: the new role of business associations – to which, however, parliament remains to a large extent unresponsive (Natasha Hamilton Hart); the regulations designed to prevent political parties from exacerbating regional and ethnic cleavages (Benjamin Reilly); the impact of administrative decentralization in different areas (I Ketut Erawan); the threat from radical Muslim lobbies to freedom of religion, which is guaranteed by Article 29 of the Constitution (Arskal Salim); and the position of children's rights in recent legislation (Sharon Bessel). Taken together, the chapters in this volume demonstrate the urgent need to explore the relationship between democracy and the state, a relationship which will eventually determine the fate of Indonesian citizenship.

Patrick Ziegenhain's book *The Indonesian parliament and democratization*, based on his 2005 University of Freiburg dissertation, offers a review of the development of the Indonesian parliament between 1999 and 2004. Ziegenhain aims to investigate what kind of role parliament played, while at the same time trying to put his topic in a broader academic and comparative context. In this respect the book still shows many traces of its origins as a thesis, which is not always inviting for further reading. Ziegenhain identifies three stages: liberalization (1997-1998), democratization under Habibie (1998-1999), and democratization under Megawati (1999-2004). His main conclusion is that the developmental trajectory of the Indonesian parliament since 1997 has not deviated much from the pattern usually seen elsewhere in the world following the end of authoritarian regimes, whereby initial radicalism and a bid for increased power are soon followed by a more moderate attitude.

I am disappointed by this book because it offers hardly any new information or insights. Both the narrative and the analysis are rather superficial. Questions concerning actual procedures in parliament, or actual power relationships, which involve particular parties and informal alliances of factions from different parties, are not addressed. How key positions are distributed among the political elite, and who dominates the most influential committees in parliament, it is not discussed. The statement that parliament was 'one of the most decisive actors for the resignation of President Suharto' (p. 204), seems highly exaggerated. The most disappointing part of the book is the few pages (154-9) devoted to constitutional reform. Although the author promises to apply an actor-oriented approach to this topic (p. 8), in the end he presents only a brief summary of what should have been the centrepiece of his book. Although Jakob Tobing seems to have been one of his key informants, no attention whatsoever is paid to the crucial role Tobing played in the process of

constitutional reform. We learn more in this respect from the article by Ellis than from Ziegenhain's book.

Laurent Sagart, Roger M. Blench, and Alicia Sanchez-Mazas (eds), *The peopling of East Asia; Putting together archaeology, linguistics and genetics*. London, New York: RoutledgeCurzon, 2005, xxiii + 323 pp. ISBN 0415322421. Price: USD 200.00 (hardback).

ALEXANDER ADELAAR
University of Melbourne
karlaa@unimelb.edu.au

This volume is the result of a workshop on phylogeny of East Asian languages, organized by Laurent Sagart and Stanley Starosta 29-31 August 2001 in Périgueux, France. It brings together linguistic, archaeological, physical anthropological, and genetic research in an attempt to arrive at an integrated theory about the origins of the peoples and languages of East and Southeast Asia. The main sections are on archaeology (Part 1), linguistics (Part 2), and genetics and physical anthropology (Part 3). In the Introduction the editors give a clear overview of the five language families investigated (Sino-Tibetan, Austronesian, Hmong-Mien, Austro-Asiatic, and Thai-Kadai) and the various macro-phyla (larger genetic linguistic configurations that include several language families) that have been proposed. They also give an overview of the themes discussed in the chapters.

The archaeological, linguistic and physical anthropological chapters can be summarized as follows.

In 'The farming-language dispersal hypothesis in the East Asian context', Peter Bellwood explains that the initial (or 'foundation') dispersals of many major language families in tropical and temperate areas occurred after the establishment of an agricultural economy and the population increase which tended to go along with it. Bellwood also evaluates previous research on agricultural and linguistic expansion and then concentrates on two questions: (1) How and where did agriculture develop in East Asia, and how many different populations were involved in the process? (2) What were the main expansion trends in the relevant language families?

Rice was first cultivated along the Yangzi River, and millet along the Huanghe (Yellow) River. The domestication of millet in China remains unclear. Since common millet seems to have been introduced in Europe and China around the same period (6500 BC) and is unlikely to have been domesticated more than once in separate areas, Bellwood speculates that it was

introduced by Indo-Europeans (Tocharians) from Central Asia via Xinjiang and Gansu.

Bellwood concludes with a map outlining the possible distribution of early Neolithic cultures in China and Southeast Asia, showing the hypothesized homelands of the language families involved.

In 'From the mountains to the valleys. Understanding ethnolinguistic geography in Southeast Asia', Roger Blench observes a pattern in East Asia where a single ethnolinguistic group expands to such an extent that it outnumbers all related ethnolinguistic groups in the region. He argues that ethnolinguistic expansion in East Asia is linked to geography, and more specifically to lowland rice cultivation and the conjunction of mountainous terrain with flooded lowlands. Most river basins and flood plains are occupied by a single ethnic group (often forming a state), which practises lowland rice cultivation using irrigation and natural flooding. The remainder of the population lives mostly in mountainous regions and uses slash-and-burn methods. These mountainous regions typically show more cultural, agricultural and linguistic variety, and Blench believes that they are more representative of the historical situation than the lowlands. The spread of rice cultivation holds the key to understanding the present-day linguistic situation in such areas. Blench also examines rice terminologies reconstructed for the various language families in East Asia in order to trace the routes of introduction of the crops they designate. Rice may not have been the direct engine of expansion of these language families. It is only after rice took over from millet varieties as a dominant crop in lowland areas that it became a driving force behind localized demographic expansion.

Tracey L-D Lu ('The origin and dispersal of agriculture and human diaspora in East Asia') gives an overview of recent research and discusses the spread of millet and rice cultivation. In the Neolithic (circa 8500 BP), the Yellow Valley was the core area for millet farming, and the Yangzi Valley for rice cultivation. In 7000 BP, rice cultivation seems to have expanded into the Yellow Valley, possibly in tandem with rising temperatures and more rain. The spread of millet into the Yangzi Valley was apparently much more limited, although this observation requires further research. The early farming societies in the Yellow and Yangzi Valleys were culturally very different, but, as Lu points out, that does not necessarily mean that they were ethnically different. Rice and millet cultivation were the preoccupation of many Neolithic groups. The expansion of these crops to other parts of China seems to be just as much the result of prehistoric cultural contacts and exchanges as of population movements. There also seems to have been little cultural resistance in China to new cultivars. In Taiwan, however, the Austronesian peoples regard millet as their sacred grain and show a certain resistance to rice. This apparent inconsistency between archaeological and ethnographic data has impor-

tant theoretical implications, which are ill understood. Therefore, priority should be given to archaeological research into the origins of rice and millet cultivation in Taiwan.

In 'Recent discoveries at the Tapengkeng culture sites in Taiwan', Tsang Cheng-Hwa explains that until recently there had been difficulties in establishing Formosan language groups and linking them up with variations and developments in archaeological cultures. The Tapengkeng or 'Corded Wire' cultural sites are the earliest Neolithic sites in Taiwan. They have often been associated with the first Austronesians. In fact, until recently the few sites that had been excavated did not provide enough evidence to demonstrate this. However, since 1984, many new Tapengkeng sites have been discovered. Especially the Kuo-yeh site on Peng-hu Island and Nan-kuan-li and Nan-kuan-li East in Tainan County (southeast Taiwan) have the potential to link the Tapengkeng culture with later cultures in Taiwan and to clarify its age, economic patterns, and external affinities. Nan-kuan-li and Nan-kuan-li East also provide clear evidence of rice and millet farming in the Tapengkeng period.

Gérard Diffloth ('The contribution of linguistic palaeontology to the homeland of Austro-Asiatic') highlights some important issues involving the Austro-Asiatic homeland. The fact that Proto Austro-Asiatic animal terms refer to tropical animals makes it unlikely that this homeland was in the middle Yangzi region, even if the climate there was presumably warmer in the past. The Burma-Assam-Bangladesh region is a more likely homeland because it shows the greatest genetic diversity of Austro-Asiatic languages, particularly in the hilly areas, which still practise dry-rice cultivation today (Proto Austro-Asiatic only had terms for dry-rice cultivation). They have not been affected to the same degree by centralization and power politics as the fertile plains with their wet-rice agriculture. Finally, the striking somatic differences between Austro-Asiatic speakers (including the Munda, Vietnamese, Khmer, and Orang Asli) must be due to language shifts in the past. These shifts deserve priority in linguistic and human genetic research.

In 'Tibeto-Burman vs Indo-Chinese; Implications for population geneticists, archaeologists and prehistorians', George van Driem gives a historical overview of the subgrouping theories involving Chinese, Tibetan and Burmese. He also gathers multidisciplinary evidence to argue for a Tibeto-Burman family and for its homeland in Sichuan. His Tibeto-Burman is not a branch of Sino-Tibetan (as conventionally held) but a label for a larger language family combining all Sino-Tibetan languages with the Brahmaputran languages and possibly some others. Van Driem refers to the conventional Sino-Tibetan groups as 'Eastern Tibeto-Burman'. He includes the Brahmaputran languages in a 'Western Tibeto-Burman' category, which possibly forms more than one primary branch. His conclusions also vindicate Von Klaproth, who

argued 200 years ago for a Tibeto-Burman family in which Chinese, Tibetan and Burmese were phylogenetically on a par. It is only later that scholars introduced the label 'Indo-Chinese' or 'Sino-Tibetan' for this language family, and that they began to subgroup Tibetan and Burman together with the exclusion of Chinese, while including (until the 1940s) the Tai languages in the overall language family.

Paul Benedict (1942, 1975) gathered evidence for a genetic relationship between Austronesian and Thai. Thurgood (1994) has criticized the lexical evidence for such a macro-phylum, arguing that it points to borrowing because it allegedly does not exhibit regular sound correspondences. Weera Ostapirat uses lexical and phonological data to demonstrate that Benedict's theory was right in spite of his methodology, which was largely wrong. In fact, the sound correspondences between Austronesian and Thai-Kadai (or 'Kra-Dai' in Ostapirat's terminology) are often strikingly regular, provided that adequate lexical data and proto-forms are used and that tonal differences are also drawn into the comparison. Ostapirat believes that Kra-Dai was a sister language of Austronesian. In contrast to Sagart, he does not consider Kra-Dai to be coordinate with Proto Malayo-Polynesian or even descended from East Formosan, because it has retained various Proto Austronesian phonemic distinctions that were lost in East Formosan. However, towards the end of his chapter he does seem to warm up to Sagart's idea (without entirely giving in to it) that Kra-Dai is subordinate to Austronesian. He also believes that its homeland must have been along the Guangdong or Fujian coast (4000 BP).

In 'The current status of Austric', Laurie Reid evaluates the lexical evidence gathered by Hayes (1997, 1999) for a macro-phylum including Austronesian and Austro-Asiatic. He also revisits the morphosyntactic evidence in the light of recent observations made by Ross (2000), Thurgood (1999), and Sagart. While still believing that Austronesian and Austro-Asiatic are genetically related, he is not sure any more whether they should be interpreted as sister branches of an exclusive Austric. They may be members of a larger Sino-Tibetan-Austronesian phylum such as defined by Sagart, and not necessarily coordinate members.

Laurent Sagart has been arguing for almost two decades that Chinese and Austronesian are related. In 'Sino-Tibetan and Austronesian; An updated and improved argument', he presents 75 basic and cultural vocabulary items as well as sound correspondences and shared morphology to demonstrate a genetic link between the integral Sino-Tibetan language family and Austronesian. In this comparison he also draws evidence from Tibeto-Burman languages and Old Chinese. He observes 'a substantial cultural unity between the Austronesian peoples of Taiwan and the Sino-Tibetan peoples' (p. 172), which has become undeniable since the discovery of the Nan-kuan-li and Nan-kuan-li East sites. Both Austronesians in Taiwan and Sino-Tibetans

had an agriculture based on two millet varieties (*Setaria italica* and *Panicum miliaceum*), with rice as a third cereal crop, and both performed religious rituals in which millets played a major role. They once formed a single farming community speaking 'Proto Sino-Tibetan-Austronesian', which lived in the mid Huang He Valley between 8500 and 7500 BP.

In Sagart's perspective, Austronesian also includes the Thai-Kadai languages. In a small separate chapter titled 'Tai-Kadai as a subgroup of Austronesian' he reiterates the evidence for the idea he has been advocating since 1997, namely that Proto Thai-Kadai is a daughter language of Austronesian belonging to the 'East Coast Linkage'. The latter also includes Proto Malayo-Polynesian and the Formosan languages Siraya, Amis, Bunun, Kavalan, and Basai-Trobiawan. Proto Thai-Kadai speakers must have left eastern Taiwan and re-migrated to the Chinese mainland, settling along the Guangdong coast.

In 'Proto-East Asian and the origin and dispersal of the languages of East and Southeast Asia and the Pacific', Stanley Starosta elaborates on the idea that the five language phyla under discussion in this book are related. He proposes that they have all descended from a single proto-language, Proto East Asian, which diverged into two branches: Proto Austronesian (as defined by Sagart) and Sino-Tibetan-Yangzian. The latter split again into Pre-Sino-Tibetan and Proto Yangzian. Proto Yangzian in turn has two branches, Proto Hmong-Mien and Proto Austro-Asiatic. Proto East Asian was spoken some 8,500 to 8,000 years ago by millet farmers, who are archaeologically represented by the Peiligang and Cishan cultures on the North China Plain. It had a CVCVC word structure and the following nominal affixes: m-/<m> for agent, -Vn for patient and sV- for instrument. It also had a perfective marker n-/<n>. Starosta's proposal leaves no room for an Austric hypothesis and works on the assumption that the Tapengkeng culture in Taiwan was pre-Austronesian.

Michael Pietrusewsky's chapter 'The physical anthropology of the Pacific, East Asia and Southeast Asia; A multivariate craniometric analysis' makes use of new skull measurement techniques to investigate the historical-biological relationships of peoples in East Asia and the Pacific. His main conclusions are that there are two sharply contrasting divisions in the area, namely an Australo-Melanesian complex (including Australians, Tasmanians and Melanesians) and an Asian complex (including the inhabitants of East, North and Southeast Asia as well as Remote Oceania). These complexes of peoples most likely have separate origins. The Polynesians form a discrete branch of the Asian complex, which is closest to cranial series from insular Southeast Asia. The Micronesian series is variable, in some places (like Guam) showing affinities with Polynesia, and in other places (like the Caroline Islands) with Melanesia. The Southeast Asian cranial series forms two branches, which are

clearly separated from the East and North Asian cranial series. There is no connection between Ainu and Pacific cranial series.

Five other chapters deal with human genetics. They are 'Genetic diversity of Taiwan's indigenous peoples; Possible relationship with insular Southeast Asia' (Marie Lin et al.); 'Genetic analysis of minority populations in China and its implications for multiregional evolution' (Jiayou Chu); 'Comparing linguistic and genetic relationships among East Asian populations; A study of the RH and GM polymorphisms' (Estella S. Poloni et al.); 'HLA genetic diversity and linguistic variation in East Asia' (Alicia Sanchez-Mazas et al.); 'A synopsis of extant Y-chromosome diversity in East Asia and Oceania' (Peter A. Underhill). Marie Lin et al. only deal with mountain peoples. However, the 'Sinicized' (= now Chinese-speaking) peoples in the western plains are also indigenous Taiwanese. By excluding these Sinicized groups, the authors have missed a good opportunity to investigate the extent of aboriginal gene spread in Taiwan.

Lack of knowledge of human genetics prevents me from discussing the contents of these chapters any further. Suffice it to say that by and large the findings in these chapters seem neither to contradict, nor to significantly correlate with, the linguistic and archaeological findings. While progress in the study of human genetics is rapid, it may still take some time before it can contribute to interdisciplinary prehistoric research in the same straightforward way as archaeology, linguistics and physical anthropology have done.

Some of the claims made by individual authors need further qualification. Bellwood's speculation that Tocharians introduced common millet to China is rather premature. It is unclear why Chamic rice terms should have been borrowed from Malay (in Blench's chapter, p. 42). The subgrouping hypotheses advanced by Van Driem and by Starosta lack supporting evidence. True enough, Starosta does provide some morphological evidence. These morphological reconstructions may seem impressive, but the reality behind them is usually less straightforward than appears from Starosta's presentation, which is based more on general typological considerations than on a painstaking application of the comparative method. Meanwhile, the groundwork of lexical and phonological comparison is apparently left to others. Some unduly speculative assertions in his chapter are that there were contacts between Austronesians and Nicobarese, and that the Siraya were 'the first successful sea-born colonists from the [Taiwanese east coast] area' (p. 186): what is the historical or ethnological evidence for such claims? In addressing Thurgood's criticism, Ostapirat assumes that the presence of regular sound correspondences means that no borrowing was involved, but this is by no means always so. It is also unclear why this author uses Atayal words to stand in for Proto Austronesian etyma (p. 111, 121): if this is justified, he should have explained why. Sagart's East Coast Dialect Linkage is based, in

part, on *pang- 'instrumental construction' as a shared common innovation between Amis and Proto Malayo-Polynesian (p. 162). While its reflexes are indeed often used to form instrumental nouns, this seems to be a secondary development triggered in many languages independently. In the history of West Indonesian languages, for instance, it must originally have been a prefix for active verbs in subordinate clauses (it was the counterpart of *mang-, which was used in main clauses). Such forms often developed into deverbal nouns; although their meanings were not role-bound from the outset, they often ended up being used as instruments or agents. Compare Malay *pukul*, *mamukul* 'to beat, strike', and *pamukul*, which means 'hammer' as well as 'someone who strikes, beats'.

The volume also contains some editorial errors and errors in presentation, although there are not too many of these, and they do not usually impair reading. Given the fact that the publisher, Routledge, leaves it up to authors to do all editorial work, the authors are to be congratulated for a difficult job well done. The chapter by Blench has an inaccurate title, as it also covers China and Japan but excludes most of insular Southeast Asia. The Proto East Asian tree diagram on p. 183 in Starosta's chapter includes a false alignment in its bifurcation to the left (that is, Tangut-Bodic is not descended from Proto Himalayo-Burman but from Sino-Bodic). While Ostapirat sets out with a healthy dose of caution about a possible genetic link between Kra-Dai and Austronesian at the beginning of his chapter (on p. 108), towards the end of it (p. 125) he appears to be a strong advocate of this theory, which is confusing.

The problem with historical linguistics at such a macro-level is that there are many competing attempts to establish macro-phyla. These macro-phyla may look convincing individually but are often mutually incompatible. One would therefore be inclined to look for alternative explanations such as contact, borrowing and bilingualism. However, although these phenomena are mentioned in the book, one feels that the authors make little use of them to explain the data they come across. And in the few cases where they do make use of them, it only adds to the speculative nature of the theory (for instance, when borrowing is used to explain non-Austronesian words in Austro-Thai/Kra-Dai).

All these theories about the peopling of East Asia remind us of a food market with a huge choice of products (including, no doubt, rice and cereals), many stallholders, and an attractive arrangement of fruits, vegetables and other merchandise. We came to do shopping, but there are many products we do not really need or which cannot be trusted even if they look good. Nevertheless, there is constant pressure on us to buy too much because of the skilful rhetoric of the stallholders trying to catch our attention.

But this comparison is not to deny that this is a book of crucial importance.

It is a fascinating read, rich with ideas, and a must for everyone interested in East Asian prehistory. The high level of combined scholarship it represents will bring the reader up to date with the latest progress in a fast-changing field of study.

References

- Benedict, Paul K.
 1942 'Thai, Kadai and Indonesian; A new alignment in southeastern Asia', *American Anthropologist* 44:576-601.
 1975 *Austro-Thai; Language and culture, with a glossary of roots*. New Haven: HRAF Press.
- Hayes, L.H.
 1997 'On the track of Austric: Part II. Consonant mutation in early Austroasiatic', *Mon-Khmer Studies* 27:13-44.
 1999 'On the track of Austric: Part III. Basic vocabulary comparison', *Mon-Khmer Studies* 29:1-34.
- Ross, Malcolm D.
 2000 [Review of] E. Zeitoun and P.J.-K. Li (eds), *Selected papers from the Eighth International Conference on Austronesian Linguistics, Oceanic Linguistics* 39-2:445-56.
- Thurgood, Graham
 1994 'Tai-Kadai and Austronesian; The nature of the historical relationship', *Oceanic Linguistics* 33-2:345-68.
 1999 *From ancient Chamic to modern dialects; 2000 years of language contact and change*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press. [Oceanic Linguistics Special Publication 28.]

Saw Swee Hock, *The population of Malaysia*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2007, xi + 189 pp. ISBN 9789812304438. Price: SGD 39.90 (hardback).

GAVIN JONES
 National University of Singapore
 arigwj@nus.edu.sg

This is the first comprehensive treatment of the population of Malaysia. As such, it meets a need for a book which discusses the main aspects of Malaysia's population: growth and distribution, migration (external and internal), ethnic and religious patterns, population structure, nuptiality, fertility and mortality, labour force and future population trends. Saw Swee Hock is well placed

to write such a book, having already published books on the population of Peninsular Malaysia and on the population of Singapore.

The book relies mostly on analysis of the decennial pan-Malaysian censuses conducted in 1970, 1980, 1991 and 2000, though other sources are used to update the picture to around 2005. Although in 1991 the Malaysian census takers omitted some questions asked in the other years, on the whole it is possible to derive reasonable time series from these sources. The book competently analyses population growth, changing racial and religious structure, migration patterns and trends (a crucial topic for Malaysia), and social and economic characteristics.

Malaysia's population growth since the mid-19th century has owed much to migration of Chinese and Indians. Migration contributed less, but still quite substantially, to the growth of the Malay population as well. After the Great Depression, the Second World War, and the lack of demand for foreign workers in the postwar and early independence years, the foreign-born population reached its nadir in 1980, since which it has risen again substantially as a result of new labour migration flows. The number of foreign-born (those who were recorded in the census) rose from 673,000 in 1980 to a recorded 1,563,300 in 2000. Some undocumented workers, of course, were probably missed. The upsurge was mostly from Indonesia, but there was also a substantial flow from the Philippines to Sabah. The net result of the patterns of migration, both international and internal, has been a considerable decline in the share of population in states such as Perak and Kelantan, and a rise in the share of Selangor and Sabah.

Malaysia's fertility rates differ widely between the Bumiputera, the Chinese and the Indians. Fertility trends are shown up to 2003, when the Chinese had a total fertility rate one child (or about a third) lower than the Bumiputeras. This long-standing difference was a major factor in the declining share of the Chinese in Malaysia's population. Rates for all ethnic groups have actually fallen since 2003, with Chinese fertility levels now clearly below replacement level.

The chapter on ethnic and religious patterns will be particularly valuable to readers trying to make sense of the mosaic of the Malaysian population, a mosaic which has major political and social ramifications. The chapter on labour force shows clearly the effect of lengthened periods of education in delaying entry of young people into the labour force. It also enables the reader to get a clearer picture of the continuing differences in occupational patterns among the different ethnic groups and, by showing occupational composition by citizenship status, the role of foreign migrants in the economy.

In analysing urbanization, there is no discussion of the growth of conurbations, dominant among which is the Kuala Lumpur area, which now holds almost one quarter of Malaysia's total population. In discussing the table

presenting the population of the top urban centres, descending gradually in population size from Kuala Lumpur (at 1.3 million in 2000) to the twentieth largest (Georgetown) at 181,000, Professor Saw does make passing reference to the fact that six of the top 20 are in Selangor, though not to the more startling fact that five of the top 10 are in Selangor. The fact is that the population of the Klang Valley conurbation centered on Kuala Lumpur was approximately 4 million. While Professor Saw notes that Kuala Lumpur's population was double that of Malaysia's second city, Johor Bahru, he does not note the more relevant fact that the Klang Valley conurbation's population was more than five times larger than that of Johor Bahru.

The chapter on nuptiality has its shortcomings. While proportions single in different age groups and the calculation of singulate mean age at marriage do give a useful picture of trends in entry into marriage, the same cannot be said of use of 'stock' data on percentages currently divorced for analysis of divorce trends and patterns, because the stock data are greatly affected by patterns of remarriage. The discussion on divorce totally misses the major changes in divorce patterns of the Malays over recent decades, discussed by this reviewer in a book and a number of readily accessible journal articles.

Henk Schulte Nordholt and Fridus Steijlen (producers), *Don't forget to remember me; A day in the life of Indonesia*. CD-Rom, based on the Audiovisual Archive 'Recording the Future'. Camera: Andre Triadiputra; camera and interviews: Lexy Junior Rambadeta; editing: Martine Scheen, Tuhuteru and Partners; audio: Shaun Spencer; subtitles: Ahmad Baihaki, Upik Djalins; voice-over: Anna Yeadell. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2008. Price: EUR 14.90.

JEAN GELMAN TAYLOR
University of New South Wales
jeant@unsw.edu.au

A day in the life of Indonesia takes place in bus stations, schoolyards and government offices, at market stalls, on wharves, in backyard worksites, in sports arenas, in quiet streets on Bintan Island at dawn, and in the convivial noise of densely populated alleys and living quarters perilously planted on the banks of Jakarta's mud-brown river. Leisure and work go on in crowded, cramped spaces. A dominant impression is how hard people work and how few are the protections for workers. Men without protective clothing, eye shields or

safeguards of any kind beat red-hot metal bars into tools and adjust machinery. They bend under huge loads barefooted on slippery paths, work twelve and more hours a day at repetitive tasks in that busyness of the underemployed and underpaid. Their responses to the cameraman are monosyllabic, but older bystanders exude a sense of enjoyment in company. They welcome the moving camera and chat with the film crew.

The film is made up of segments filmed across the archipelago from Indonesia's two largest cities to provincial towns and villages. We follow the unfolding of the day in eight locations and far into the night as lives are lived on street corners, at stalls, eating places and *becak* stands. People are constantly on the move atop jitneys, by motorbike, train, boat and inter-island plane, their possessions in plastic bags and battered boxes, their capital invested in drink bottles, cooking supplies, and electronic equipment. No Borobudur looms out of the mists, no grand monuments or beautiful people from the pages of Indonesia's glossy magazines. Instead there are soccer fans, police, office personnel, sales staff, a restaurant owner at his cash register.

Frank Dikötter writes in *Things modern; Material culture and everyday life in China* (London: Hurst, 2007) that material and mental landscapes are altered permanently by ordinary people who deliberately absorb objects into their daily life on the basis of rational calculations about use, benefit and return; they participate in global economic and cultural trends as historical actors, not passive targets. This film serves up the visual evidence for Dikötter's observation. Advertisements for National and Panasonic are part of the streetscape, people sing in karaoke venues, they wear the West's T-shirt, they perform aerobic exercises to a cassette player, watch Indonesian soap operas on television, check a computer screen. Indonesians are open to, and ready users of, modern technologies.

The film is an hour-long record edited from the Audiovisual Archive being compiled by the KITLV in conjunction with the Indonesian Institute for the Sciences (LIPI). Filming, interviews and sub-titling are the work of the Indonesian team members. Filmed subjects respond variously to the film crew with warmth, deference or wariness. Production is by Henk Schulte Nordholt and Fridus Steijlen who in this, as in earlier projects, demonstrate a personal commitment to depositing into social history a record of 'the little guy', and to demonstrating how sound and sight can furnish data for the social sciences and enrich textbook studies.

Filming began in 2003 – five years after the fall of President Suharto, one year after the Bali murders. It continued through to 2006. In the interval were the election campaigns and the turning point for Indonesia's democracy, when President Megawati Sukarnoputri accepted the decision of millions of ordinary Indonesians and stepped down upon electoral defeat instead of provoking a coup. But moments in the daily lives captured here on film seem

only lightly touched by the state and the big issues Indonesia confronts. The camera records the noisy chaos of children learning to read Arabic in Ternate; it films young and old for whom the mosque appears in all its shiny splendour as a place to hang out. We sense the presence of government in the large billboards exhorting citizens to be disciplined and work hard, in the morning ceremony of flag raising and singing 'Indonesia Raya' in a school ground in Sintang, in the uniforms of municipal employees. 'The government should limit the number of motorbikes for sale', a bus driver in Surabaya says to the camera, 'because they're the reason fewer people use public transport and why drivers have less work'. We also get a sense of absence of government: skills not adequately used by a high school graduate working in a noodle shop in Payakumbuh; another woman says relatives are the only social support for the unemployed. We receive a strong impression of the great variety of people and situation among the lower middle and working classes, of ingenuity in turning circumstances into a living, resilience, lack of dentistry, lives lived without much material comfort, hot, littered workshops, offices with no shelving to store record books.

How plugged in are Indonesians to the outside world! Young boys playing soccer on an overgrown field in West Kalimantan proclaim AC Milan and Juventus as their favourite teams; older adolescents in Central Sulawesi lounge in a clubroom decorated with posters of Kurt Cobain. Everywhere there is the characteristically Indonesian uptake of English terms and phrases: check-in, koordinasi, yes! A local Elvis sings 'Don't forget to remember me'.

The opening narration warns us that everyday life, once forgotten, is lost forever; without film, there is no record for the future. This KITLV Project is, therefore, a good deed, and a valuable corrective to images of the securely rich, the politically influential and the crazed fanatics who perform for television news crews. I see this moving, sound record as the 21st century's version of the black and white photographs stored in the KITLV Images Archive. In those old photos taken between 1857 and 1940, Dutch and Indonesian stare fixedly at the camera, surrounded by identifying objects, loved ones and servants. Anthropologists and historians of the colonial camera often condemn such photographs as examples of the colonial gaze, a record of lives judged unrepresentative, staged, othered. They may perhaps find fault with this new photographic documentation from the KITLV. Now, however, the worldly, sophisticated photographer is the middle class Indonesian cameraman thrusting his lens and sound recorder into peoples' faces in urban slums and rural worksites. Could the people immortalized on this CD really exercise their right of refusal? But perhaps here is what is always the possibility lurking in the photographs from *Tempo Doeloe*, the desire of the photographed to be seen. Don't we find here that same human urge to be remembered for a moment on

film, perhaps to see oneself, to assert I too am part of history and my life in all its ordinariness also matters? 'Nowhere else is as nice as here', says a mother, second generation resident of Jakarta's appalling slums. Maria Dermoût wrote that our lives are made up of the daily round; she called it the individual's ten thousand things (*De tienduizend dingen*, Amsterdam: Querido, 1955). To me, this CD is precisely that, a beautifully achieved record, a source of knowledge, a commitment to humanity. I plan on screening it for my students in Indonesian and Southeast Asian history.

Karel Steenbrink, *Catholics in Indonesia; A documented history*. Volume I, *A modest recovery 1808-1900*; Volume 2 (with the cooperation of Paule Maas), *The spectacular growth of a self-confident minority 1903-1942*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2003, 2007; xviii + 534, xiii + 634 pp. [Verhandelingen 196, 232.] ISBN 9067181412, 9067182607. Price: EUR 47.50 x 2 = EUR 95.00 (paperback).

CHRIS DE JONG

Paterswolde

cgf.de.jong@home.nl

After being almost wiped off the religious map of the Dutch East Indies as a consequence of the disappearance of the Portuguese in the 17th century, during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, after the Dutch East Indies Company (VOC) had given way to a colonial state which was neutral (formally at least) with respect to Christian denominations, Roman Catholicism staged a comeback. After a slow start, this comeback gradually gained momentum from the second half of the nineteenth century onward.

Karel Steenbrink's excellent two-volume study traces the modern development of the Roman Catholic mission in Indonesia. In doing so it focuses predominantly on Indonesian Roman Catholic Christians, the grass roots, instead of on the organization of the Church. Each volume contains a historical survey together with a number of documents, reproduced in their original languages (Latin, Dutch, French, and Malay), covering the periods 1825-1903 (Volume 1) and 1903-1945 (Volume 2). Each of the documents, 98 of them in the first and 40 in the second volume, is preceded by a short introduction. The work also contains various appendices, maps, photos, a bibliography, and indices.

Chapters 1 and 12 of Volume 1 discuss, among other things, the more general question of whether a common pattern can be found in the con-

versions from indigenous traditional religion to the major scriptural world religions now present in Indonesia. An important element of this pattern, which is also touched upon in other writings by Steenbrink, is the fact that many Indonesians never felt, and still do not feel, the need to 'choose' in a rigorous way between religions. Conversion seldom involves the complete abandonment or replacement of previously held religious beliefs. Both the Catholic and the Protestant missions in the Dutch East Indies were confronted with this phenomenon, although they dealt with it in different ways. The dynamics of conversion are at the heart of what after the Second World War became known as 'contextual theology'.

This is an important matter, as Steenbrink's generalizing contention that the 'different function of tribal religion compared to a world religion probably makes possible the harmony and lack of competition between the two' (Vol. I, p. 9) may be true of Roman Catholicism, but I am not sure that every nineteenth- or early twentieth-century Protestant missionary would have agreed (although after 1930 the tone of the Protestant discourse on this issue tended to mitigate somewhat). While I found Chapter 12 of Volume 1 valuable in this respect, the author could have done his readers a service by inserting in Chapter I of that volume a section on the *theologia religionum* or theological anthropology of the Roman Catholic Church. The use of the term 'adaptability' in relation to the Catholic tradition (Vol. 1, p. 233) might also have called for some theological background, bearing in mind that an important Catholic teaching is that all people are created in God's image and therefore contain a spark of divinity. But how brightly does the spark shine? And are there as many paths to God as there are human beings? A further legitimate question seems to me to be: how far is Steenbrink's quoted generalization related to, or even a logical consequence of, Catholic doctrine on relations between the Church of Rome and other Christian denominations and non-Christian religions and belief systems? A section answering these and related questions would have put the rest of Steenbrink's study in even clearer perspective.

Chapters 2 to 11 of Volume 1 are dedicated to the history of Catholicism in specific areas of the Dutch East Indies. Starting in Java around 1800, the author takes the reader on an anti-clockwise journey via the islands of Bangka, Borneo and Sumatra to the southeast and northeast, and finally back to Java. The eleven chapters of Volume 2 discuss various topics, ranging from the formation and reorganization of the structure of the Roman Catholic Church in the Indies, through the participation of the Church in the making of West Papua, to the daily life of Indonesian Catholics, the place of the Church in late colonial Indonesia, and the educational and medical work of the Church.

During much of the period discussed in this study, mutual trust between the Holy See and the Dutch colonial government was still limited. In the eyes of many government officials, the spread of Roman Catholicism in the

colony was almost as undesirable as the spread of Islam. In so far as they had any interest in religious matters, their sympathy was mainly with Dutch Protestant missionary organizations, although they hardly said so in public. Relations between the Catholic mission and the government, particularly at local level, were sometimes complex, if not downright uneasy.

The important and much-contested Paragraph 123 of the Constitution of the Netherlands Indies (*Regeeringsreglement*, 1854), which stipulated that all teachers of Christianity should obtain a special permit (*bijzondere toelating*) to carry out their work in any given area, and which was meant to prevent unwanted rivalry between mission organisations, is briefly discussed in Volume 1 on pages 208-9, and again in Chapter 12. However, since this Paragraph 123 (which came on top of a special agreement concluded between The Hague and the Vatican in 1847) had a huge impact all over the colony, and until its abolition in 1926 severely limited the access of the Roman Catholic mission to highly coveted mission fields, one would have expected it to be discussed in detail in Chapter I.

Some minor irregularities may be mentioned. In the list of abbreviations (Vol. 2, p. ix), names of Dutch organizations are sometimes accompanied by an English translation, but sometimes not; in still other cases, only the English version is given. The title on the cover of Volume 1 mentions the period 1808-1900, whereas elsewhere the cutoff year between the volumes is given as 1903. Also perplexing is the statement (Vol. I, p. 231) that many Protestant missionaries were not ordained ministers and could not administer the 'Eucharist'. Even when ordained, which all of them were, they would not have dreamt of administering the (Roman Catholic) Eucharist! Most of them were, however, fully authorized to celebrate the Holy Supper with the non-European congregations in their mission fields. Finally, the book ignores the fact that beginning in the late 1920s, local government officials in many parts of Indonesia attempted in the context of the Indies Administrative Reform (*Indische bestuurs hervorming*) of that period to 'restore' traditional institutions which had been destroyed during the previous decades. This had a direct impact on the activities of most mission organisations, as it tended to reinforce the position of Islam at regional and village levels.

But I shall not dwell on such details. Especially at a time when worldwide Roman Catholicism seems more robust than it was only a generation ago, and the Catholic Church is the largest single supplier of health care and education on the planet (Ian Linden, *Global Catholicism*, Columbia University Press, 2009), this is an excellent and valuable study, the qualities and usefulness of which are by no means impaired by such trifling matters.

Pamela J. Stewart and Andrew Strathern (eds), *Exchange and sacrifice*. Durham, North Carolina: Carolina Academic Press, 2008, xxxvi + 257 pp. ISBN 9781594601798. Price: USD 42.00 (paperback).

TOON VAN MEIJL

Radboud University, Nijmegen

t.vanmeijl@ru.nl

This collection of essays has been compiled to honour the legacy of Daniel de Coppet, an influential French anthropologist who died unexpectedly on the day of his retirement and on his birthday at the age of 69. De Coppet had an established reputation as ethnographer of the 'Are'are people of Malaita in the Solomon Islands, while he was also influential as leader of a distinctive research group of the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS) in Paris. On the basis of his ethnographic research, De Coppet developed theories about the relationship between death, exchange, sacrifice, the ancestors, and concepts of the person and society. For De Coppet, death constituted a critical dimension in the generation of relations of exchange not only among the living, but also between the living and the dead. These relations of exchange, he argued, transpired especially in societies in which the cosmos and society were believed to be intricately intertwined, such as in Melanesia. Among the 'Are'are, for example, leadership was supposedly consecrated via the circulation of shell valuables and their prestation to ancestors and supernatural beings. In De Coppet's view, this demonstrated how the totality of 'Are'are society was consummated through ceremonial practices, in which social relations were symbolically manifested and hierarchically defined. Following his teacher Louis Dumont, he argued that objects and persons, as well as their symbolic representations, flowed through ceremonial exchanges that embodied a 'hierarchy of values', linking all things natural, human and supernatural to the socio-cosmic regeneration of life.

The book opens with a general introduction, written by the editors, to anthropological theories on the topics of exchange and sacrifice, and their implications for theories of society and the person. Since De Coppet's work has been published mainly in French, the first chapter of this volume contains a translation of one of his articles about the differences and transformative comparabilities between the 'body' in Western societies and ideas regarding 'money' in Melanesia. This paper also addresses the problems of cross-cultural and multilevel comparisons in anthropology.

Other essays focus on various ethnographic aspects of the relationship between exchange and sacrifice. Two chapters by noted French scholars focus on exchange and identity. Denis Monnerie points out that in most

exchange systems various forms of exchange coexist in order to cope with changes, while Pierre Maranda shows how metaphors play an important role in representations of socio-cosmic synergy as identified in Melanesian rituals of exchange. All other chapters have been contributed by scholars who situate themselves more in the Anglo-Saxon tradition of anthropology. Both John Liep and Edward Lipuma with Benjamin Lee examine the concept of holism in the work of De Coppet, but on the basis of their research on Rossel Island and among the Maring respectively they appear highly critical of his assumptions, interpretations and generalizations. In the final section, dealing with the historical dimension of exchange practices, Michael Scott, Shankar Aswani and Anton Ploeg focus on change and the creativity of Pacific peoples in refashioning their societies out of earlier totalities. In a final chapter the editors continue the theoretical reflections with which they opened the volume, but relate these at the same time to exchange and sacrifice among the Melpa in the Western Highlands of Papua New Guinea.

Interestingly, most contributors do not engage with De Coppet's corpus of writing in any detail, while most of them are also rather critical of his views. They might recognize that his work generated an interesting debate about hierarchy, holism, the concept of society, and the place of individual persons in society, but by and large they find his theoretical contributions rather speculative and over-generalizing, if not functionalist and ahistorical. As a consequence, one may wonder how De Coppet himself would have received this edited collection. However, while most contributions take issue with De Coppet's assumptions of enduring structures of hierarchy and holism, the collection does highlight the fundamental connections between exchange and sacrifice as ritual practices within cosmological frameworks. In sum, the volume derives its value primarily from its rich ethnographic analyses of the complex relationship between exchange and sacrifice in Melanesian societies.

Hans Straver (samenst.), *Wonder en geweld; De Molukken in de verbeelding van vertellers en schrijvers*. 2 delen. Utrecht: Landelijk Steunpunt Educatie Molukkers, 2007, 437 + 424 pp. ISBN 9789076729459. Prijs: EUR 54,50 (gebonden).

G.J. SCHUTTE
Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam
schutte31@zonnet.nl

Deze prachtig uitgevoerde bloemlezing publiceert teksten uit zeven eeuwen van schrijvers uit Azië en Europa, die gezamenlijk een breed en gevarieerd beeld van de Molukse geschiedenis schetsen. En met name natuurlijk de betekenis van de ontmoeting van Nederlanders en Molukkers in die geschiedenis. Want weliswaar zijn de oudste teksten ontleend aan niet-Nederlandse en niet-Molukse bronnen, en ook voor de latere tijden ontbreken die zeker niet, maar toch: de meeste teksten zijn geschreven door Nederlanders en Molukkers die op allerlei manieren aan elkaar verbonden waren en zijn.

De bloemlezing is opgebouwd rondom twee-en-dertig themata, ingedeeld in vier afdelingen, en ze volgen meer of minder de tijdsbalk. Het eerste gedeelte bestaat uit verhalen, zangen en vertellingen, vroeger of later schriftelijk vastgelegd, die een oude orale vertelcultuur introduceren: volksverhalen en liederen die de Molukse mens iets willen leren, zijn afkomst, levenswijz en context helpen verstaan. De tweede afdeling brengt de lezers naar de koloniale tijd, zestiende tot negentiende eeuw, waarin de nagelrijke specerijeneilanden sterke aantrekkingskracht hadden en dus allerlei geweld opriepen. Het geeft de oudste Chinese en Europese teksten over de nageleilanden, verslagen van de eerste Europese bezoekers, berichten over de Hollandse onderwerping van de Molukse eilanden. En de verwerking ervan in de Nederlandse literatuur van de 19e en vroeg-twintigste eeuw – een contrastem niet zelden. Deel drie weerspiegelt drie eeuwen bewondering voor de Molukse natuur, cultuur en samenleving, in diverse teksten, van Rumphius tot Herman Keppy. In het laatste deel staat de laatste eeuw centraal: het koloniale soldatenleven, de overgang naar Nederland, het heimwee en de herinnering. *Wonder en geweld* bundelt op die manier ruim 130 (fragmenten van) verhalen, beschrijvingen, gedichten, rapportages, literaire en andere reacties en overpeinzingen van mensen uit allerlei tijd en achtergrond. Bekende, minder bekende en een enkele keer zelfs onbekende teksten en dito auteurs, ingeleid, geannoteerd en zonodig vertaald of hertaald. Een nuttige en interessante bloemlezing.

Wonder en geweld is geen gemakkelijk te categoriseren boek. Het gaat over geschiedenis maar het is geen historisch handboek of historiografische monografie; het bundelt veel antropologisch materiaal en interessante literair-historische teksten, maar is geen handleiding op die vakterreinen. Het wordt gepresenteerd als een impuls voor de leescultuur binnen de Molukse gemeenschap in Nederland; gehoopt wordt ook dat het de aandacht voor de Molukse eilanden kan vergroten onder studenten en leraren. *Wonder en Geweld* is dus een soort met negentiende-eeuwse zorg en degelijkheid samengesteld (cultuurhistorisch) leesboek. Als zodanig heeft het kwaliteit en is het niet zelden boeiend en verrassend. Diverse themata laten uiteraard het verschil zien tussen Nederlanders en Molukkers en hun uiteenlopende visies op hun onderlinge verhoudingen: Ridjali contra Bor bijvoorbeeld, of rondom Pattimura en Martha Christina Tiahahu. Maar de bundel toont ook hun

onderlinge verbondenheid en beïnvloeding. Een voorbeeld, ook van Stravers werkwijze, is het thema 'Raadsels op rijm'. Dit verenigt gedichten van Hélène Swarth en Klaas Kleine (een Drentse dialectdichter) met Molukse in vertaling van W.A. Braasem, de *Bijbelse raadsels* van I.H. Enklaar, *Badendang* liederen en nog het een en ander, gecombineerd met een essayistische introductie/annotatie. Dertig bladzijden over de pantun-traditie.

Wonder en geweld verwerkt dus allerlei wetenschappelijke perspectieven, maar is geen doorgaande kritische verhandeling; het heeft, afgezien van een opgave van de herkomst van de opgenomen teksten en een summiere literatuurlijst, zelfs geen index van besproken onderwerpen, noch van opgenomen en anderszins besproken auteurs. De introducties tot de themata, auteurs en teksten groeien soms uit tot ware essayistische aanzetten tot hervertolkingen en heroverwegingen – maar allemaal even uitdagend als toevallig, ongelijkmatig in opzet en omvang. Kortom: een bloemlezing die niet het academisch onderzoek, maar de leescultuur – daar en daarbuiten – wil dienen.

Dendy Sugono et al. (eds), *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Pusat Bahasa; Edisi keempat*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, Pusat Bahasa, Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, 2008, xlii + 1701 pp. [Originally published as *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*, Jakarta: Balai Pustaka, 1988.] ISBN 9789792238419. Price: IDR 375,000 (hardback).

HEIN STEINHAUER
Leiden University
h.steinbauer@hum.leidenuniv.nl

Rather unpractical for the average user, this fourth edition of the big monolingual Indonesian dictionary (KBBI-4) distributes its entries over four sections, the body of the dictionary and three appendices. This arrangement was inherited from its immediate predecessor (KBBI-3), from which, however, it also differs in many respects.

Traditionally, derivations by means of inherited morphological processes are treated as subentries of the main entries, that is, their lexical roots. In KBBI-4 the order of these subentries has been changed in order to make the derivational relations between them more transparent. The necessary desktop manipulations for this rearrangement have apparently led to the accidental disappearance of some entries and subentries. Nikolaos van Dam in his review of the dictionary in the journal *Tempo* (5 April 2009, p. 96) notes

the absence in KBBI-4 of the entry *bengkel* (with subentries *membengkel* and *perbengkelan*). The disappearance of the subentries *mengebom*, *pengebom*, and *pengeboman* under the entry *bom* 'bomb' is another example.

In the appendix of words and expressions from regional Indonesian languages (pp. 1582-3) some entries have vanished too, Javanese *mangga* 'go ahead' for instance, and Sundanese *punten* 'excuse me'; some others (such as Javanese *nrima* 'to be uncomplaining') have been shifted to the body of the dictionary, still others have been added. Criteria for inclusion in this appendix are unclear. The more so since the body of the dictionary also contains loanwords from regional languages, whether inherited from KBBI-3 or added intentionally, the latter perhaps to support the claim that Indonesian is enriching local languages instead of threatening them and that that enrichment is mutual. This has led to rather unlikely lexical items, for example, *kiwalu kowibi* 'tikar dari daun pandan atau akar bawea, pinggirnya dihiasi kain berwarna merah, hitam, dan putih, digunakan khusus bagi pengantin' from Wolio, *longo wulaa* 'gigi yang teratur dan indah' from Tolaki, or *nawarapoka* 'prinsip yang menuntut bahwa suatu pemberian yang sifatnya material atau imaterial harus dibalas (kembali)' from Mimika. The introduction to the dictionary (p. xxxiii) lists more than 70 (of the 500 to 700) regional languages, or regions in some cases, which have contributed in this way to the Indonesian lexicon. The names of two of these, Abrab and Putuk, cannot be found elsewhere.

The second appendix of lexical entries (pp. 1584-1617) contains (lesser adapted) loanwords from foreign languages. The list is longer than the one in KBBI-3, but the most striking difference is that Arabic loans are made more Arabic and less Indonesian. To give one example: the first item of the list, '*alam arhām*'. Arabic loans which were already included in the body of the dictionary, however, such as *assalamualaikum*, remain unchanged.

The third appendix (pp. 1627-52) deals with acronyms and abbreviations. It contains many new items, but is not free of inconsistencies and gaps. Frequently used abbreviations/acronyms such as ABG (< *anak baru gedé*) 'adolescent' are not included, probably because they belong to urban youth culture; likewise, CD is only given as short for Corps Diplomatique, whereas it also stands for *celana dalam* 'underpants' (and 'compact disk'). Some acronyms are (also) included in the body of the dictionary, presumably because they are the base for further derivations, for example *cerpén* (< *cerita péndék*) 'short story' with the derivation *cerpénis* 'short story writer'. Illustrative of the flexibility of Indonesian is the existence of derivations from abbreviations, such as *meng-acc(kan)* 'approve of', *meng-abs-i* 'flatter', *mem-phk-kan* 'lay off (a worker)'. But the appendix lists only these abbreviations and not the derivations based on them: *ABS* (< *Asal Bapak Senang*), *acc* (< accord), *PHK* (< *pemu-*

tusan hubungan kerja).

One of the major changes in the body of the dictionary is the addition (and better definitions) of names of flora and fauna, with the result that the dictionary now contains a lot of useful encyclopaedic information. The entry *badér* for instance, absent in KBBI-3, is described in KBBI-4 as 'ikan air tawar yang ukurannya mencapai 40,5 cm, hidup di dasar perairan tropis dengan kedalaman lebih dari 15 m; *Barbonymus gonionotus*'. The subentry *telinga gajah* 'pohon; *Macaranga megalophylla*' in KBBI-3 has become 'pohon, tinggi hingga 20 m, kayunya tidak awet, digunakan untuk membuat gagang pisau, tangkai pacul, dan kasut kayu, daunnya besar, digunakan sebagai pembungkus makanan; *Macaranga gigantea*' in KBBI-4.

Less conspicuous, but also an improvement, is the endeavour to define comparable concepts or categories in comparable ways. However, there remain lexical fields where more consistency in the definitions would be welcome. A vexing example is the uncertainty about the proper terminology for numerals higher than a million. Compare the following definitions.

<i>biliun</i>	1 satuan bilangan yang dilambangkan dengan dua belas nol (000.000.000.000) di belakang angka 1-9 [sic] (di Inggris dan Jerman); 2 satuan bilangan yang dilambangkan dengan sembilan nol (000.000.000) di belakang angka 1-9 [sic] (di Amerika Serikat dan Prancis)
<i>triliun</i>	1 satuan bilangan yang dilambangkan dengan 12 nol (000.000.000.000) di belakang angka 1-999 (di Amerika Serikat dan Prancis, digunakan juga di Indonesia); 2 satuan bilangan yang dilambangkan dengan 18 nol (000.000.000.000.000.000) di belakang angka 1-999 (di Inggris dan Jerman)
<i>kuadriliun</i>	1 sepuluh pangkat lima belas di Amerika; 2 sepuluh pangkat delapan belas di Inggris
<i>kuintiliun</i>	1 sepuluh pangkat lima [sic] belas di Amerika; 2 sepuluh pangkat tiga puluh di Inggris
<i>sekstiliun</i>	sepuluh pangkat 21 (10^{21})
<i>septiliun</i>	sepuluh pangkat 24 (10^{24})
<i>oktiliun</i>	sepuluh pangkat 27 (10^{27})
<i>noniliun</i> [sic]	sepuluh pangkat 30 (10^{30})
<i>desiliun</i>	satuan bilangan besar (di atas satu juta) yang dilambangkan dengan 33 nol pada sistem Amerika atau dengan 60 nol pada sistem Inggris

If the meaning of the English/German equivalents of the Indonesian entries

are to be mentioned at all, one would expect to find alongside *miliar* 'seribu juta' other entries ending in *-iar*.

The major difference with KBBI-3 is the overwhelming number of new terminological entries. The dictionary contains some 300 different phobias, for instance, ranging from *novérkafobia* (fear of one's stepmother) and *krisofobia* (fear of the colour orange), to *héksakosioihéksékontahéksafobia* (fear of the number 666). Among the abnormal propensities one may find *kiroptérofilia* (attraction to bats), *mégamalofilia* (attraction to apples or the Big Apple (New York)), and *pigofilia* (attraction to abdomens). The afflictions ending in *-filia* appear to have counterparts ending in *-fili* indicating the person afflicted with the ailment: a *hirsutofili* is someone suffering from *hirsutofilia* 'attraction to hairy men'. Pairs like these introduce a new morphemic pattern which has not been copied from a foreign language, but which is originally Indonesian.

The inclusion of scientific terminology unavoidably requires encyclopaedic definitions. Some of these definitions contain terms which require further explanation for the uninformed reader. For a term such as *spagétifikasi* 'proses teleportasi yang belum sempurna yang menyebabkan benda yang dikirim hancur seperti spageti', this is no problem, since *téléportasi* is also an entry. But the explanation for *spéktropolariméter* 'alat untuk mengukur sudut putar bidang polarisasi pada berbagai panjang pengukuran spektrum' poses problems since neither *sudut putar* nor *bidang polarisasi* are dealt with as examples or compounds.

In general the number of compounds in KBBI-4 is limited. KBBI-4 gives ten compounds having *sudut* as the first element (one more than KBBI-3), but the major bilingual dictionaries, R.N. Korigodskij et al. (eds), *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia-Rusia. Bol'shoj Indonezijsko-Russkij Slovar'* (Moskva: Russkij Jazyk, 1990), and Allan M. Stevens and A.Ed. Schmidgall-Tellings, *A comprehensive Indonesian-English dictionary* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2004), are far richer: there are seventeen compounds in the former and thirty in the latter, with only partial overlap.

The large number of scientific terms and lengthy explanations gives the impression that the dictionary is describing the world rather than the everyday lexicon, let alone the spoken language. The extended title of the dictionary, *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia Pusat Bahasa* (instead of merely *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*), also suggests that the dictionary is chiefly prescriptive. And although it does contain a significant number of entries described as colloquial (some with better explanations than in KBBI-3), one looks in vain for many common colloquialisms, such as *aja*, *udah*, *tuh*, *gitu*, *gini*, *gimana*, *ngga(k)* and *ga(k)*, *wong*, *lho*, *bilang* 'to say', and the slangy *bokap* 'father' (in contrast to its counterpart *nyokap* 'mother').

A persistent problem of Indonesian lexicography is the semantic predictability and necessity to include derivations. KBBI-4, incidentally, has more

subentries than its predecessor, but the big bilingual dictionaries tend to have many more. A related problem is the difficulty to semantically differentiate the various derivations. Now they are often treated as synonyms (for instance *mengupingi* 'menguping', *bersundal* 'menyundal', *tunggu* 'bertunggu', *bantah-membantah* 'berbantah-bantah'). This blurring of semantic distinctions, inherited from KBBI-3, is made worse by the semantic description of entries which used to be precategorical by means of a derived form with the prefix *meN-*. Given entries such as *lihat* 'melihat', *taruh* (*cak*) 'menaruh', and *panggil, memanggil* '...', one must assume that the many cases like *rangkul* 'merangkul' can only mean that *rangkul* is not a colloquial (*cak*) variant of *merangkul*, but – comparable to *lihat* – a standard one, which it is definitely not.

No dictionary is perfect, and KBBI-4 is no exception. But it is technically much better edited than its predecessors, and with its rich terminology and encyclopaedic explanations it certainly is an improvement on them.

Jacqueline Vel, *Uma politics; An ethnography of democratization in West Sumba, Indonesia, 1986-2006*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2008, xvii + 277 pp. [Verhandelingen 260.] ISBN 9789067183246. Price: EUR 34.90 (paperback).

CHRIS LUNDRY
Arizona State University
lundry@asu.edu

Indonesia's remote island of Sumba has been the subject of fascinating work in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. Works by authors such as Jill Forshee, Gregory Forth, Istutiah Gunawan-Mitchell, Janet Hoskins, Oemboe Hina Kapita, Webb Keane, Joel Kuipers, and Rodney Needham have reached audiences well beyond the tiny circle of Sumba Studies. Jacqueline Vel's *The Uma economy* (1994) is another such work. Her new book, *Uma politics; An ethnography of democratization in West Sumba, 1986-2006*, will appeal not only to those interested in Sumba or Eastern Indonesia, but also to others studying the micro-processes of democratization and autonomy (including *pemekaran*, the creation of new administrative districts). And although prior work on Sumba has been largely anthropological and only tangentially focused on politics, Vel's new ethnography places politics at the centre.

Vel began her study of Sumba in 1984, working with a Christian development organization there at the height of the Suharto era and before any substantive liberalization of Indonesian politics on the local scale had taken

place. The volume is a collection of essays, four of them previously published between 1992 and 2007 and updated here, that trace themes such as the meaning of 'democracy' and 'decentralization' in the local context. Vel also explains the outbreak of violence in West Sumba in November 1998. Contrary to other explanations of violence in Indonesia that often focus on religious differences, Vel notes that increasing competition in a democratic setting, combined with dissatisfaction over ethnicity-linked corruption, led to the 'Bloody Thursday' event, and the subsequent shift in leadership. This analysis is consistent with other local studies, such as those in Ambon, and exposes the local implementation of democratization in Indonesia as the messy process that it usually is. Vel's inclusion of brief vignettes depicting life in Sumba provides meaningful context for the analytical chapters.

Currents reflected in past scholarship on Sumba run through Vel's analyses. These include an emphasis on ritual speech, which Sumbanese elites use to display their strong ties to the spirit world (*marapu*) and to bolster their legitimacy as political leaders. In the context of *pemekaran*, elements of ritual speech were mixed with 'modern' language to gain popular support for creating new administrative divisions. Ultimately these groups were successful; West Sumba has been divided into three *kabupaten* from the original one. This use of ritual speech and other elements of Sumbanese politics raises the topic of political and social continuity and change, important to Vel's analysis. Yet in discussing politics in Sumba, there are many complicated elements to consider in these terms. The 2004 election of a *bupati* (regent) in West Sumba is illustrative: a vote for a Golkar candidate for *bupati* who was not from the traditional elite caste (*maramba*) may represent continuity in terms of the party's influence in Sumba, but it also signifies change in that this was the first time a non-*maramba* was voted into the office. In emphasizing some of the change in Sumbanese politics, Vel downplays some important signs of continuity. When 'success teams', for example, were mobilized to rally support for a candidate, they were referred to as 'investors' (p. 214), yet the leadership of these teams, organized down to the village level, were almost entirely *maramba*; despite the 'growing of the political public' in Sumba (p. 15), caste remains deeply influential.

On a much less substantive note, inattentive proofreading in the chapters that were not previously published is a distraction. Nonetheless, Jacqueline Vel's *Uma politics* is a valuable contribution to the study of Sumba, as well as an in-depth case study of the implementation of political change on the local level, something often missing in the Jakarta-centered analyses of policy formation and in the literature on policy implementation, which so often focuses on regions in conflict.

C.W. Watson, *Of self and injustice; Autobiography and repression in modern Indonesia*. Leiden: KITLV Press, 2006, xiv + 237 pp. ISBN 9067182729. [Verhandelingen 236.] Price: EUR 25.00 (paperback).

ROXANA WATERSON

National University of Singapore

socroxan@nus.edu.sg

This volume forms an extension of Watson's earlier work on Indonesian autobiographies, published in the book *Of self and nation; Autobiography and the representation of modern Indonesia* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2000). The autobiographies considered in that volume are deeply revealing of the formation of Indonesia as an independent nation, their authors having in different ways lived in expectation of it or contributed to Independence struggles, at the same time as they themselves were shaped by that goal. Further pursuing that fascinating interface between individual lives and the shaping forces of wider social movements, Watson has now turned his attention to Indonesia's more recent history, whose previously tabooed areas have been opened to fresh scrutiny since the fall of Suharto. What of those who suffered grave injustices in the counter-coup that brought the New Order into being, or in the continuing repressions that kept Suharto in power for over three decades? Their voices are only now beginning to be heard within Indonesia, but they shed fresh light on the darker aspects of that period. Given the extent to which the New Order controlled and distorted the production of history to suit its own ends, it is now perceived by many, as Watson puts it, 'to have abused the collective consciousness of the nation' (p. 33). Thus the multiplication of alternative perspectives from different actors is vital to the ongoing process of reassessing the past.

With this volume, then, Watson makes accessible to an English-speaking readership the contents of a range of writing that is not always easy to come by even within Indonesia. The autobiographies featured in his first volume are those of individuals who had all achieved prominence either in politics or as writers, including such well-known figures as Kartini, Tan Malaka, Hamka, and Sitor Situmorang. Those discussed here are less familiar, even obscure, but they have much to tell us about bitter experiences and oppositional positions within the Indonesian political scene during the second half of the twentieth century. Watson has been at pains not only to search out the most revealing of these writings, but also to interview some of the authors in order to be able to contextualize their accounts more fully. These serve to shed light not just on actual events, but on how those events were experienced. They can inform us about structures of feeling, the formation of historical consciousness, and how individuals strive to make something

of their lives within a given set of circumstances and constraints. Moreover, they can help us to recover some sense of the atmosphere and *mentalité* of the times, especially in the 1950s, without which it is difficult fully to understand the catastrophe of 1965-1966.

Watson pays close attention to motivations and to how each author has chosen to frame their account, the starting-point selected, and what may have been omitted as much as what has been included. He is attuned to questions of voice (the persona constructed by the writer, the 'tone, tenor and temperament' (p. 3) of an account, and the subtle interpretations these may convey), matters which he judges have been too often overlooked in historical and anthropological analyses of autobiography. He pays attention, too, to the dual time of autobiography – that of the action and that of the writing, often separated by decades, with all of the attendant potentials for hindsight, as well as the intended audience and the circumstances surrounding publication. Many of these particular narratives have been written with a view to informing members of a younger generation, who have grown up largely in ignorance of the politics of the 1950s and the atmosphere of the Sukarno era, and who are unaware just how much Suharto's opponents suffered. Watson also touches on questions of intertextuality, and how already existing genres (such as prison narratives) may provide a template for telling one's story in a particular way. This can become a limitation: many of the accounts so far published by those who suffered arrest and imprisonment in 1965-66 display 'a worrying uniformity' (p. 7), in that they tend to begin with the moment of arrest and shed little light on the author's activities and experiences in the preceding period. Watson has therefore ranged widely in his choice of narratives, to ensure as much variety as possible. Above all, he tells us, he is prompted by the concern that both Indonesian intellectuals and foreign scholars tend to pay scant attention to indigenous sources, so that his aim is 'to emphasize the giving of appropriate recognition to indigenous versions of political and historical reality' (p. 7).

The narratives presented here include those of two self-declared Muslim Communists, Hasan Raid and H. Achmadi Moestahal, both of whom seek to explain and justify their opinions, then and now, about the compatibility of Islam and Communism. As strange as this may seem to a younger generation, presumably there were many at the time who felt and argued as they did. Then comes an account by a woman, Sudjinah, a journalist who was a senior member of Gerwani, the left-wing women's organization so falsely demonized by New Order propaganda. She was arrested in 1967, tortured, and imprisoned until 1983. Watson is impressed by the brave dignity of her account, and surmises that its revelations of the deceptions built in to New Order ideology must come as a shock to members of a younger generation who endured repetitive indoctrination at school in the form of the compul-

sory annual film show, dominated by the haunting images of Gerwani members' supposedly orgiastic behaviour at Lubang Buaya. Utuy Tatang Sontani was a left-wing writer who spent years in exile in China and Russia, who writes passionately of his early Communist idealism, and his subsequent disillusionment on witnessing the excesses of the Cultural Revolution in China. A.M. Fatwa and Deliar Noer were two Muslim opponents of Suharto, one a politician who subsequently, in 2004, rose to become deputy speaker of the upper chamber of the national Parliament (DPR), the other an intellectual. Two concluding chapters bring us up to date, with their examination of collections of recent autobiographical accounts by much younger writers who, while they have not suffered the imprisonment and maltreatment meted out to earlier opponents, have been moved to activism, whether of a secular or a Muslim variety, by their observations of everyday injustice in Indonesian society.

It must be said that this book is a somewhat drier read than the earlier volume, for as Watson himself admits, one of the challenges he faces here is that not all of these autobiographies are particularly well written. They have not, after all, been chosen for style so much as for what they reveal of the times. This observation should not, however, be allowed to detract from his valuable accomplishment in seeking out and contextualizing these materials. Watson, with his unusual combination of talents both as an anthropologist and a literary critic, was just the person to bring this collection together.
